

#### DIMITRINA MIHAYLOVA

### Social Capital Research in Central and Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union

An Annotated Bibliography

#### © Central European University

The Center for Policy Studies holds copyright for the working papers series. For normal educational purposes and with appropriate citation and acknowledgement, we are happy to allow the reproduction in whole or in part of this text.

The views expressed in this bibliography represent the views of the author and should not be taken as the position of the Center for Policy Studies, Central Eurpean University, Budapest or any other institution.

CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES
CENTRAL EUROPEAN UNIVERSITY

Nádor utca 9 H–1051 Budapest, Hungary

cps@ceu.hu http://www.ceu.hu/cps

Dimitrina Mihaylova

Institute for Social and Cultural Anthropology University of Oxford, Oxford, UK Dimitrina.Mihaylova@linacre.ox.ac.uk

March 2004

Copy-editing • Andrew Cartwright Typesetting • Tamás Dombos

#### CONTENTS

1.	General Works	4
2.	Civil Society and Social Capital	8
3.	Economic Activities and Social Capital	18
4.	Education and Social Capital	24
5.	Health and Social Capital	30
6.	Institutional Change and Social Capital	35
Au	thor Index	49

CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES WORKING PAPER SERIES

#### 1. GENERAL WORKS

#### Hann, Chris (2002) Postsocialism. Ideals, ideologies and practices in Eurasia, London: Routledge

In this reviewer's opinion, this is one of the best collections to date on the post-socialist changes. It also includes three papers that approach social capital from a strong anthropological perspective. Each serves as a convincing demonstration of the broad applicability of a micro-level approach. As set out in the preface, the aim of all the volume is to show how social transformation affects the everyday social relations of post-socialist citizens. The introduction, in three parts, sets out some of the achievements of this research and outlines several new directions in studying post-socialism in Eurasia. The first section is made up of three chapters devoted to social capital studies.

The first, by Martha Lampland, provides a critical assessment of some of the main approaches to transition, including the applicability of rational-choice theory and the debates concerning formal and informal institutions. Based on the works of Bourdieu, Lampland offers an alternative approach through a case study concerning the privatization process in Hungary. She shows how long experience in running a farm combined with previously developed social contacts was as important for success in the market economy as education. Adopting a critical stance towards some of the prevailing theories of privatization, the chapter argues that economic activities need to be understood as intrinsically linked to culture, beliefs, perceptions, motivations and moral principles.

The second chapter demonstrates how privatization and the market economy can undermine social cohesion. The author shows how the decline of ritual highlights political and economic difficulties and on rural dissatisfaction and disappointment with transition. Creed concludes that the decline in the frequency of rituals and the levels of participation in them diminishes local social capital, thereby exacerbating feelings of helplessness and dislocation.

The third chapter considers the social production on mistrust in Bulgaria. The authors argue that the rift between legitimacy and legality of the state (in the process of ill conceived and implemented land privatization) increased mistrust in the state. People approached the state as an obstacle to be avoided while the ruling elite saw citizens as having dubious loyalty. The case studies provide very vivid descriptions of those real life mechanisms that serve to produce and reproduce mistrust.

### Burawoy, Michael and Katherine Verdery (1999) *Uncertain transition. Ethnographies of change in the post-socialist world*, Oxford: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers

This volume is a significant contribution to the study of institutions, property, networks, trust and association in the post communist period. The editors see the collapse of the party states and administered economies as creating space for micro-worlds that can exert an influence on the newly emerging structures. An ethnographic approach is adopted to study the micro-processes that people initiate in response to post-socialist transformations. The introduction offers a critical overview of various theories of transition. The editors argue that the day-to-day realities of post-socialism demonstrate a complex inter-penetration of system and life world, micro and macro, global and local levels, something that the editors contend is best understood through ethnographies the challenge the conventional metaphors and approaches to 'transition'.

The volume demonstrates the difficulties in separating the economic realm from the political and the cultural. Transformation is a complex process suspended between the past and the future. Not only is it uneven, it also has multiple trajectories. The shift to a market economy is characterized with both a 'regressive' and a 'progressive' dynamic. Simple comparisons with Western models are often less helpful than comparisons with other post-communist countries. The first chapter examines how

new regulations concerning citizenship rights led to various defensive reactions among traders, expressed in the formation of exclusivist kin networks and heightened ethnic loyalties to form cross-border patterns of trust and protection. The second chapter considers the role of the old elite in the transformation process and documents how new property rights created new social dynamics and a new field for social action in Romanian villages. The chapter on rural support to the Bulgarian socialist party offers an excellent analysis of the reasons for and the ways in which rural people resist institutional change through voting. The chapter on Siberian miners is extremely interesting and demonstrates how collectives from the socialist period are transforming themselves today and how former socialist leaders continue to mobilize support from 'alienated' collectives.

#### Stulhofer, Alexander (2001) Chapter Two, in Nenad Stare (ed.) *Human Development Report*, UNDP, Croatia

This chapter presents an analysis of the relevance of social capital to Croatia. It builds on data from the World Value Survey, Croatia 1995, and the European Values Survey, 1999. It recognises the power of social capital as a concept and points to its emergence in Croatia in scientific discussions but also in the media and in political programs and strategies. The author asks why despite being vague and empirically unverified, social capital has received such a prominent place. He finds the answers in previous experiences with international economic and political development, arguing that its strength comes from its recognition of the important role that culture plays in economic growth.

The author proposes the following definition of social capital: a cluster of cultural characteristics that create and maintain mutual trust and co-operation within a community or a social group. It is created and maintained in everyday interactions and it made of pro-social values and norms rooted in cultural tradition. Social capital facilitates co-operation and as a collective resource it has a positive influence on development. It is seen as particularly relevant in the context of Croatia, which, according to the author, has suffered a 'cultural collapse' with dominant values destroyed or lapsing into a state of anomie. The legacy of the socialist under-development of civic society is also seen as important. The measurement of social capital is considered indicative of the course reforms may be heading. The following sections explore each of the three suggested dimensions of social capital: trust, association and respect for social norms, or civicness, which are mutually related.

Some inconsistencies, such as the high level of social capital at the very end of the war, are explained with the argument that the war may have stimulated social capital creation. For example, in 1995 Croatia was declared the 'most religious' country in Europe with the large membership of churches. Recommendations to policy makers take the form of trying to remove obstacles to trust, association and civicness. The author argues that social capital arises spontaneously as a side product of civic initiative and path-dependant cultural dynamics. It is also recommended that supporting values are created through educational programs, media campaigns and through the establishment of a capable and efficient state apparatus.

This paper provides an insightful questioning of some social capital measurement techniques. He discusses critically some of the limitations of these techniques, for instance the difficulties of indirect measuring yielding precise findings. The application of some of these particular definitions may limit the methodology and findings. However, this paper marks a promising opening in the search for more adequate concepts.

CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES WORKING PAPER SERIES

### Mateju, Petr (2002) 'Social capital: problems of its conceptualisation and measurement in transforming societies', Conference Paper, *OECD/NNS Conference on Social Capital Measurement*, London, September 26–27

This paper contains a useful overview of methodological developments concerning social capital, in particular, methods that may be used for its measurement. The author recognises that, at this stage, measurement can only be indirect and thus there is still a lot of work needed to secure the explanatory power of the concept. The introduction reviews briefly some of the major theories of social capital. The second section discusses measurement strategies in transforming societies. The author recommends four steps for future research: to delineate reliable indicators; to create scale for the different dimensions of social capital; to analyse the different dimensions of social capital; to assess the relationships between these dimensions and other relevant variables such as position in class structure, etc. Attention is drawn to the importance of one's position in the social structure in relation to social capital.

The strong conclusion focuses on the importance of taking a critical position towards the applicability of Putnam's model to transitional societies. Instead of focusing on issues of general trust and civic participation, the author suggests that it may be more useful to study the role of 'weak ties' (networks in Bourdieu's terms) and the indicators of a person's active involvement in building networks. The paper is a significant contribution to the study of social capital in Central and Eastern Europe suggesting a very specific approach to transitional societies.

## Raiser, Martin, Christian Haerpfer, Thomas Noworthy and Clare Wallace (2001) 'Social capital in transition: a first look at the evidence', *European Bank for Reconstruction and Development Working Paper No. 61*

The authors believe this to be the first collection of social capital data in the transition countries of Central and Eastern Europe. They use the World Values Surveys of 1990 and 1995 to document the degree of trust and civic participation, finding there to be lower levels of social capital in comparison to the OECD countries. The authors find that, in contrast to market economies, trust is not positively correlated to economic growth in transitional countries. However, the authors do find a positive correlation between trust in institutions and economic growth.

In the opening section, the authors define the main concepts they use and argue that only the use of the definition of 'formal social capital' can lead to unambiguous proposals concerning the impact on the economic performance in a specific country. The following section explores the negative effects of the totalitarian regimes on trust and social capital. Further sections provide comparative material between the post-socialist countries and some OECD countries. One finding is that trust in friends in the richer countries of OECD is correlated with the level of generalized trust (trust towards outsiders) while in the post-socialist countries social circles seem smaller and more closed and do not suggest such correlation. Civic participation is also found to be lower than in countries with fully developed market economies. Trust in public institutions is found to be a consequence and not a prerequisite for the accumulation of social capital.

The unresolved problems faced by the authors are variations in civic participation. Three important factors are named as creating discontinuities: religious affiliation, GDP per capital and rate of urbanization. It is suggested that one way to reinforce the benefits of civic engagements to economic growth is by facilitating self-enforcement of market rules without the need for recourse to third party enforcement by formal institutions (such as the state). As the authors argue, there is no convincing evidence that reforms work more effectively where civic participation or trust in governments are high. At the same time, civic participation is correlated with economic growth. Trust in public institutions such as legal system and the police is correlated with economic growth while the

correlation with political institutions is less so. The conclusion endorses Putnam and Coleman's findings. The authors argue also that keeping live the hope of 'returning to Europe' may be useful to help build trust. It is suggested that reducing high levels of income inequality could be important to increase trust in others and in the public institutions. Another recommendation is that governments should eschew chauvinistic tendencies within their countries, which only serve to exacerbate social divisions and undermine trust.

The analysis offered is an uncritical application of the concept and its measurement in post-socialist countries. One limitation is that each survey measures a different aspect of trust and form of social participation undermining both the comparisons between post-socialist countries and comparisons with OECD countries.

#### Bjornskov, Christian (2003) 'Corruption and social capital', Kyklos, Vol. 56 (1), pp. 3-16

This paper examines the relationship between social capital and corruption through the methods of rational choice theory. Quantitative data from the European Values Survey and the World Values Survey is used to measure social capital using the national scores on generalized trust. Some of the findings such as the claim that 'social capital has historically very deep roots depending on the dominant religion in the country' raise questions concerning the data and concepts used. The author argues that investments and encouraging interest in society (by ensuring media are independent and more accessible) lead to more social capital as well as some degree of income redistribution. The author suggests that his findings suggest that social capital can reduce corruption and concludes that this would 'facilitate economic growth and other desirable features of society'. Unfortunately, due to its methodological limitations the paper tends to raise more questions that it can solve.

▼ CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES WORKING PAPER SERIES

#### 2. CIVIL SOCIETY AND SOCIAL CAPITAL

Engberg, Ulla and Paul Stubbs (1999) 'Social capital and integrated development: a civil society grants programme in Travnik, Bosnia-Herzegovina', *Plymouth International Papers No. 11*, International Studies Centre, University of Plymouth

This paper offers an exemplary approach to evaluating the participatory components of development programs. It highlights in a constructive way the weaknesses as well as the potential of the Integrated Resettlement Program in Travnik, Bosnia-Herzegovina, in 1997–1998. It considers the theoretical approaches behind the program as well as its practical application. Although brief, the last section contains some extremely useful lessons that were learnt from the scheme and these are placed in the context of wider theoretical and practical debates. Being sceptical of social capital, the authors call for a more nuanced definition of the concept as well as detailed outline of relevant case studies. They also warn of its misuse and potential for shifting focus away from the role of the central state and local governments. Unfortunately, the section outlining the development of the NGOs in Bosnia and Herzegovina is very short even though it brings attention to some rarely commented processes such as the sometime counterproductive role of international organisations, the relationship of NGOs in formal politics, and the production of mistrust in the civil sector.

The middle sections of the paper detail the evaluation process and its findings. The recommendations in the conclusion address a broad variety of theoretical and practical implications. One important aspect is the necessity of debating the requirements for multi-ethnic membership in voluntary groups. The authors argue that non-political groups that reinforce aspects of ethnic and religious identity can contribute to generalised trust and in this sense, increase positive forms of social capital. One important methodological recommendation is that the Putnam index should not be used without qualification, rather a more reflexive, participatory and anthropological approach is suggested which could draw attention to the wider social and institutional setting of associations.

The conclusion encourages international agencies to engage in a complex analysis of the political economy of post-socialist societies where social capital is only one factor amongst many. Relationships between formal politics and local actors are seen as the outcome of complex processes that can change meanings and outcomes. The authors suggest that, in the effort to find a better ground for development, this approach is far more promising than the one that poses either 'economic development first' or 'democratisation first'

Nanetti, Raffaella Y. (2002) 'Social capital, community development and local government performance', Conference Paper, *Workshop on Social Capital*, sponsored by the World Bank, Zagreb, March 6–7, 2002.

The presentation explores some of the components social capital. At the centre, Nanetti finds social capital in the exchange of trust, the sharing of values and in the norms of solidarity. She is interested to find instances when local groups act on such values so as to monitor and prompt government into action and in her view community development is best seen as a multidimensional concept which represents a process, a movement, a program and a method. Institutional performance is defined as being a combination of two baskets: public goods and support/the enhancement of private endeavours to improve 'quality of life'. In this context, the logic of the 'virtuous circle' consists of community development planning as a key government function, as well as a function of the social capital. Social capital and local government are seen as having reciprocal and reinforcing relations. The author explores social-capital based development as a combination of planning strategies:

- purposive planning as a point of departure for political leadership;
- micro-project planning as a point of departure for the diffusion of entrepreneurship for community development;
- network planning as a point of departure for group and association organising;
- area-wide synergy planning as a point of departure for common causes for community development.

Although several interesting themes are developed in the work, the written version of the presentation suffers from its brevity and a lack of data on the three case studies from Naples, Gorizia-Nova Gorizia and Kossovo.

### Mondak, Jeffery, J, and Adam F. Gearing (1998) 'Civic engagement in a post-communist state', *Political Psychology*, Vol. 19 (3), September, pp. 615–637

This paper is part of a special issue entirely devoted to social capital at the individual and psychological level as a complementary approach to the social structural ones. The authors follow James Coleman's suggestion that human and social capital may exert influence over each other. They focus on citizen's interactions within the local community and examine how the community of Cluj-Napoca, Romania, differs from or is similar to that of South Bend, Indiana, USA. They examine if the quality of people's perceptions suffer when civic engagement is limited. And lastly, they explore the link between civic engagement and political judgment.

The authors describe five impediments to the creation of social capital in Cluj-Napoca in terms of: ethnic tensions, poor media, diffuse neighborhoods, forced settlement patterns and the negative effects of totalitarian regime. They argue, rather sweepingly, that such features are characteristic of other post-socialist regimes but that they are less significant in the West. The authors' hypothesis is, in contrast to the Romanian town, a well-established democracy in the US provides all the circumstances for the flourishing of social capital. The study describes the infrequent face-to-face interactions based on a survey of the frequency of political discussions. The similarity between the USA and the Romanian town was in the capacity to monitor national affairs via news media. In contrast to the citizens of South Bend, those in Cluj-Napoca discuss politics less, engage in interactive forms of political participation at lower rates, know less about their neighbors and fail to link the interests of people in the community to broader political judgments. Although methodological questions could be raised about the superficiality of some of the survey findings, the argument that it is necessary to delineate the factors impeding social interaction is an important contribution.

### Hann, Chris and Elizabeth Dunn (1996) Civil society: challenging Western models, London: Routledge

In the view of this reviewer, this volume is one of the best collections of civil society research to date. It makes significant advances in several theoretical and methodological debates and provides a broad comparative perspective (although perhaps there are fewer cases from Western countries than would be ideal). It serves as a good demonstration of the advantages of a strong qualitative approach to understanding an often ill-defined and ambiguous social phenomena such as 'civil society'. Many misconceptions regarding 'civil society' are challenged by a theoretical approach that is grounded in the reality of social life in the region. Not only is it a valuable collection for both experienced and young researchers, it is also an indispensable read for practitioners involved in civil society development throughout the world.

The beginning offers an excellent critical introduction into the theories of civil society and especially as applied in Central and Eastern Europe. It highlights certain western biases that contribute to difficulties in transposing civil society into the post-socialist context. Contrary to the arguments of some scholars in this field, Hann suggests that there has been a continuous movement as well as a great diversity within Central and Eastern Europe during socialism. He argues that the popularity of the term owes more for its rhetorical power than its descriptiveness of existing social realities. He sees part of the problem in the methodological difficulties of uncovering the true nature of postsocialist networks of associations. He also questions whether there is an enduring antagonism between state and society, suggesting that the idea that civil society is located outside the state belongs to a slightly 'romanticised' and 'western' notion. Despite such conclusions, the author acknowledges that 'civil society' still has a powerful appeal to many people in the world and that this provides a valid justification for its continuous research.

The various contributions are based on cases from the USA, Japan, China, Poland, Eastern Germany, Siberia, London, Albania, Turkey, Jordan, Syria, and Indonesia demonstrate that there is a need to re-conceptualise the term, for example, a gendered approach could be incorporated and religion more explored as an important sphere in the formation of civil society. According to the authors, civil society should be theorised within the wider debates concerning the state, modernity, individualism, pluralism and boundaries between private and public. The authors move way from simple dichotomies to explore the complexity of institutions that meditate self and society as well as the social relationships that underpin the functioning of states and markets (p.21). The contributions on Central and Eastern Europe focus on the important role of civil associations, informal networks, international institutions and (mis)trust produced during and after socialism. They demonstrate a need to shift debates on civil society away from formal structures and towards an investigation of beliefs, values and everyday practices. As pointed out by Hann, these are well addressed by a political anthropology that overcomes both the constraints of liberal-individualism and those in relativist/universalist debates. Understood in a broader sense, 'political society' is proposed as an alternative to the term 'civil society'.

## Cellarius, Barbara A. and Caedmon Staddon (2002) 'Environmental non-governmental organisations, civil society and democratisation in Bulgaria', *East European Politics and Societies*, Vol. 16 (1), pp. 182–222

This article is a perceptive account of environmental NGOs in Bulgaria. Its findings are based on several extended case studies demonstrating some of the strengths a qualitative approach can have in constructing theoretical models. It opens with a rigorous critique of the neo-liberal approach to civil society. The authors argue that the virtuous connections between NGOs, civil society and democracy is a relatively recent Western invention, and one that suggests that NGOs in Central and Eastern Europe should expand and occupy the space left by the withdrawing state. In the author's view, the disproportionate attention and funding that is given to environmental NGOs prevents policy makers from being able to recognise truly innovative expressions of social self-organisation. Further sections provide abundant arguments to show that the neo-liberal preconditions for NGOs to affect civil society are simply not present in Bulgaria. However, the authors suggest that the intrinsic value of the NGOs should not be underestimated, rather it should be analysed differently.

The authors find that environmental NGOs in Bulgaria are far more complex and amorphous organisations than the neo-liberal model suggests. Analyses that stress the importance of size or diversity ignore other issues such as the motivations of members, and the structures of enablement or constraint. The authors criticise the notion that the mere possibility of participation within NGOs is a sufficient good in itself. Another problem addressed in detail is the need to reassess the relationship

between the state and the NGOs. The numerous informal networks that exist between NGOs, state institutions and para-state bodies, for instance, the international donors, are analysed to demonstrate a relative lack of real NGO independence from the state. As a result the authors argue for a reformulation of the concept of civil society so as to recognise better the aspects of power within society.

## Anheier, Helmut K., Eckhard Priller and Annette Zimmer (1998) 'Civil society in transition: the East German third sector ten years after unification', *Civil Society Working Papers No. 15*, London School of Economics, Centre for Civil Society

This paper makes a significant contribution to understanding post-socialist processes of social participation. It compares and contrasts two views of the German third sector. The first argues that East German NGOs are largely an extension of their West German counterparts and are not embedded in local society. The second view claims that East German NGOs are an expression of a civil society and are rooted in a democratic culture. The authors analysed numerous case studies and demonstrate how the state has played a significant role in shaping mass social organisations in Eastern Germany.

The paper compares Eastern Germany with other Central European countries highlighting the unique position of the former. For while there are comparably low levels of volunteering in the latter countries, the third sector in East Germany is vibrant. The main reason lies with the extensive government sponsorship of the sector by contrast to the relatively little funding made available to similar organisations in the Czech Republic, Hungary and Poland. The subsidiary principle in Germany reveals the decisive role of the state in the life of civic organisations. Two different types of organisations have developed, one being socially embedded and found in areas such as recreation, sports and culture; the other being organisations that are active in the welfare and health services. The latter are becoming more business-like organisations and are abandoning the ideological roots of the past and growing increasingly similar to their West German counterparts. On the whole, East German organisations are seen to be more dynamic and more relevant to their local context than mere extensions of civil organisations from West Germany.

### Bougarel, Xavier et al. (2002) 'Local level institutions and social capital study. Findings and recommendations', World Bank Report, Vol. 2, June 2002

This report is an impressive and extensive work, offering first hand sources and an abundance of detailed analysis. The study uses participatory research approaches with both quantitative (surveys, archives, literature review) and qualitative data (focus groups and interviews). The study could be used as a framework example of a countrywide approach to social capital, delineating its relevant dimensions and relationship to other variables. The first part covers the issues of interpersonal trust, social cleavages, and formal institutions. It is divided into four subsections: decline and change in interpersonal trust; social cleavages and personal movements; social cleavages and social welfare system; and fragmentation of local level institutions.

The second part focuses on attitudes towards local-level institutions and forms of collective action. It has four subsections: a general assessment of public services and formal institutions; the relationships between citizens and local level institutions; relationships between citizens and formal voluntary associations; and forms of collective action that relate to local public services.

Some of the findings of the report can be used to explain some of the contradictory findings in other studies, especially those which solely rely on nation-wide survey and then find their own findings puzzling. This study emphasizes the importance of triangulation of sources and particularly

the use of qualitative data obtained through participatory methods. The conclusions of the report and its recommendations provide support to the Poverty Reduction Strategy of the Government of Bosnia and Herzegovina as well as help inform World Bank projects. Each conclusion is very specific and is followed by an equally specific recommendation, something that is not always found in other social capital studies. The final part contains a summary of findings by sector. The main conclusions focus on structural problems and the post-war context as the main obstacles in re-building social capital in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Amongst the main issues in the conclusion are: the problem of the post-war legal and administrative framework; the lack of a communication system; the necessity of welfare and accountability system reforms; the lack of public services and infrastructure; the necessity of a policy dialogue between civil society organizations and government; and the current lack of employment and housing solutions.

#### Dowley, Kathleen M. and Brian D. Silver (2002) 'Social capital, ethnicity and support for democracy in the post-communist states', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 54 (4), pp. 505–527

This paper offers a critical approach to the application of Putnam's theory of social capital in post-socialist societies. The authors build on previous work that suggests that social trust depends on experiences with institutions. In addition they refer to groups not normally identified within the scholarly literature. The main argument of the paper is that the polarisation of ethnic groups and majority-minority relationships in the post-socialist countries (similarly to other countries) plays an important role in the process of democratisation.

The research was designed to answer two questions: whether the usual markers of social capital correlate with democratization and second, what are (if any) the effects of ethnic divisions of these relationships. The results suggest there is scant evidence of a link between social capital and aggregate levels of democratization. After studying the ethnic variables, the authors conclude that almost universally, ethnic minorities report lower levels of pride in their countries of residence. Just before the dissolution of their state, interest and engagement in politics was found to be very high among Czechs and Slovaks. This example is one of several that show how those involved in politics or even voluntary organizations are less likely to support democracy as an ideal form of government than those with little interest or involvement in voluntary organizations. The authors argue that their findings should be conceptualized within the post-socialist transition. In Russia, the authors found that the majority has lost status while the situation for the minority has improved, thereby leading to a different degree of appreciation of democratization.

The conclusion summarizes the findings and states that social capital theory cannot be easily transported from the established democracies to ethnically plural societies in transition. The authors recommend that researchers should not assume that indicators of social capital from more homogenous societies would work just as well in ethnically plural societies.

### Kubicek, Paul (2002) 'Civil society, trade unions and post-soviet democratization: evidence from Russia and Ukraine', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 54 (4), pp. 603–624

This article argues that civil society should be re-conceptualised to include 'trade unions' as important actors in the political economy of post-socialist reforms. By doing so, it aims to broaden the understanding of democracy and criticise a distorted political economy approach that sees democracy as only based on the holding of competitive elections. The author explores the history of trade unions during the Soviet regime. He argues that unions should not always be seen as civic bodies aiming to benefit the society as a whole. On occasion they can be particularistic organisations. He finds the roots for their current weakness in the continuation of some of the old organisational structures and

leaders as well as in their political affiliation. However, the general political environment act as their major constraints.

Privatization affected the trade unions most notably in the decline of union membership by almost half. Even as the conditions for work deteriorated there was little confrontation between the unions and management. State paternalism has been replaced by private paternalism. Rising inequalities have increased the lack of union solidarity. However, some unions have remained active although 'acting locally' seems to be a dominating tendency. One detail which could have been explored further to clarify the union's wider societal involvement parallel to their shrinking economic effectiveness is the fact that Ukrainian unions still organize children's camps and exchange visits between various unions. The author argues that the political marginalization of the unions has been part of wider developments in the political and economic order that preclude democratic consolidation. The role of the political economy and the oligarchies in constraining groups in civil society must be considered. Despite its occasionally militant tone and a tendency to present only the negative sides of the trade unions, the article provides a useful illustration of the importance of context in the creation of social capital.

### Brunnell, Laura (2002) 'Cinderella seeks shelter: will the state, church or civil society provide?', East European Politics and Societies, Vol. 16 (2), pp. 265–493

This paper describes the state of citizenship for women in post-socialist Poland. It contains a great deal of detail about the legal, political and economic environment that structures the position of Polish women. It also provides insights on the relationship between the central state, local government and NGOs dealing with women's problems, in this case, domestic violence. An example from Krakow shows that local government cooperated with NGOs in a selective manner by working with predominantly Catholic ones. Catholic activists sought to provide an alternative to the secular and feminist organization which ran the existing shelter for women. The process of awarding a contract to run the shelter is examined in detail and provides an insight into how local government shapes civil participation and social healing.

Contrary to the views on domestic violence of the existing women's' shelter, the catholic body Caritas emphasised the importance of the reunification of the family. They were awarded the contract, even though this alienated that part of the population which espouse feminist values, particularly, within the Krakow intellectual elite. As a result, this group largely abandoned local politics and policies in order to focus on 'outsider' strategies such as public protests, promoting alternatives to established public policy, and establishing organisational links with feminist organisations in Warsaw and the West. In the author's view, the Krakow case demonstrates how a bottom-up approach to local policies does not always lead to fruitful partnership with the state rather than efforts to circumvent the state. It is also an example of how, by virtue of its responsive abilities for providing services, the locality actively constructs women's identities and the content of their citizenship.

The case of Krakow is contrasted with that of the city of Lodz where political polarisation prevented a uniform provision of services. Certain pre-existing connections between the central state and the quasi-public organisations were allowed to flourish and contributed to local development. The women's shelter in Lodz provides very high quality services and it is used for training of the social workers. Lodz highlights the positive contributions of bureaucratic autonomy and political patronage for third sector initiatives. The paper is a useful introduction not only to issues of civil society but also of institutional change of local government.

CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES WORKING PAPER SERIES

## Gibson, James L. (1998) 'Social networks and civil society in process of democratisation', *Studies in Public Policy*, *Working Paper No. 301*, Glasgow: University of Strathclyde, Centre for the Study of Public Policy

This article examines social networks as a key attribute of civil society, rather than the functioning of formal institutions. The author contends that social networks must be developed for an effective civil society (which he defines as a sphere separate from the state). He also argues that these social networks should be composed of weak ties (spanning relatively heterogeneous segments of society). The central hypothesis is that social networks are a means of transmitting innovative information and values in society, and following from this, people with more developed networks would be more likely to adopt democratic values and support democratic institutions. The author argues that in transitional societies, weak ties should be most effective in transmitting novel information.

The aims of the study were to determine the density of social networks; to examine how far network members engage in political discussion and the degree to which these ties cross social groups. The survey was conducted mainly in 1995 in seven countries - Bulgaria, Hungary, Poland, Russia, France, Spain and USA. The finding reveals that in themselves social networks have little to do with attitudes towards democratic institutions and that this is so whether or not that country has recently experienced political transformation. In the view of the author, the central hypothesis that social networks are an especially useful means of social learning in transitional regimes must be rejected. In his view social networks seem to be more politically significant in the West rather than in the East.

The author believes that the overall weakness of these findings is not that he is operating under an erroneous impression as to the meaning of social networks, but that there was not that much novelty to be distributed in the first place. At the time the surveys were carried out democratization was already well under way in most post-socialist countries. The data shows that the communist legacy was not an atomized society and that the attributes of social networks have little, if anything, to do with political legacies. This paper contains an implicit questioning of certain theoretical and methodological approaches and opens up the debate on how social interactions contribute to a fully developed democratic political culture. Most importantly, it questions the very meaning of the term 'civil society', while unfortunately, declining to offer any strong alternative approach.

### Kramer, Martin (1995) 'Introduction' to 'Blue-collar workers and the post-communist transitions in Poland, Russia, and Ukraine', *Communist and Post-communist studies*, Vol. 28 (1), pp. 3–11

In addition to the introduction, this volume of *Communist and Post-communist Studies* contains three articles on blue-collar workers in post-communist countries. The articles resulted from a research project (1989–1993) including a set of focused case studies, which were designed to evaluate and test certain theories of political and social change. The National Council for Soviet and East European Research provided the funding for the project and the introduction summarizes the main issues addressed.

The forms and degree of worker participation in labor and political organization (especially the strengths and weaknesses of trade union political involvement) are looked at. Each article discusses protest and demonstration as well as the workers' political and social attitudes and their electoral behavior (collective or fragmented). The group of blue-collar workers includes all industrial manual laborers involved in physical production. They have been a dominant group in Russia, Poland and Ukraine and have the potential to exert political influence through strikes. The findings explain why blue-collar workers in all post-socialist countries were remarkably quiescent during the first years of transition.

The theory of 'social contract' is critically examined for the period of socialism and some of its elements are also found to be applicable to the post-socialist period. The results describe how

corporate arrangements between labor, management and government were established. The authors recognize that it will take a long time before the informal social norms change to support new institutional arrangements but the non-confrontational pattern of labor relations seem to be the shortest way to this. According to the authors, the movement towards genuine 'social contracts' in post-socialist countries creates a political consensus, which has a positive effect on social transformations. One further aspect that is examined is the importance of ethnic divisions in this process, something that emerged as a significant issue in Ukraine.

### Gal, Susan and Gail Kligman (eds.) (2000) Reproducing gender: politics, publics and everyday life after socialism, Princeton: Princeton University Press

#### Corrin, Chris (ed.) (1999) Gender and identity in Central and Eastern Europe, London: Frank Cass

These two volumes, especially if looked at in combination, provide a broad overview of the role and position of women in the post-communist transition. The first volume contains three parts; discussing reproduction policies, gender relations in everyday life, and thirdly, the political life of women. The second volume consists of seven chapters, including an overview introduction by the editor. The focus is on women and party politics, women movements, campaign against violence, citizen activism, self-identity, and sexual discourses.

The volumes highlight the constraints that prevent women from fully participating in the transformation processes in the region. Economic, socio-political and legal changes have simultaneously created spaces for maneuver and greater opportunities to associate but this has been mainly within the NGO worlds. Women's participation and decision-making in formal politics is less common with their positions further weakened by poverty, unemployment, and a lack of adequate social services, domestic violence, prostitution and trafficking. These two volumes are an excellent introduction to the post-socialist political, economic and cultural processes through a gendered perspective. They demonstrate how the absence of such an approach prevents a full understanding of the region.

Kharkhordin, Oleg (1998) 'Civil society and Orthodox Christianity, First Europe-Asia lecture', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 50 (6), pp. 949–968

Luse, Agita (2001) 'Enlivenment through networking: charismatic Christians in Latvia', Conferenc Paper, The Spiritual Supermarket: Religious Pluralism and Globalization in the 21st Century: the Expanding European Union and Beyond. London School of Economics, 19–22 April

The first paper poses a very challenging question: does Orthodox Christianity offer a cure to the ills of contemporary Russian civil society. The author focuses on the principles of the Church, its religious practices and beliefs. He argues that until strong transcendental faith and unconditional observance of the principles of civil life descend upon each individual, the Church should abstain from involvement in civil society, even though it has the potential to provide moral and ethical guidance in a similar fashion to the Catholic Church. Most of the paper deals with theoretical approaches to the relationship between civil society and religious beliefs, practice and institutions. The paper is an interesting discussion of civil society principles although it does not provide any real life data about the everyday functioning of the Russian Orthodox Church. Instead the author outlines the new forms of networks in Russian society and assumes that the Church will only be compromised if it interferes in the civil sphere. The major problem of this paper is that it only discusses the possible role of the Church only through belief and religious practice and there is no material on the church communities and their role for expanding networks.

In contrast, the second paper has a short but very interesting section on how charismatic Christians in Latvia act as a pool of weak ties that can be utilized for finding jobs, providing health and social services, friendship, etc. Thanks to numerous and regular contacts within and across congregations, the members multiply their ties. In this way, the organizations are instrumental in creating new opportunities for social mobility and personal development.

## Letki, Natalia (1999) 'Social capital in Central-Eastern Europe: a puzzling finding', Conference Paper, *Between the Block and the Hard Place*, School of Slavonic and East European Studies, London

The paper tests the applicability of Putnam's theory of social capital to Central and Eastern Europe. It is based on data from a cross-national study that covers eleven post-communist countries: Belarus, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Lithuania, Poland, Romania, Russia, Slovak Republic and Ukraine. The first part examines government performance and citizen satisfaction with democracy. In terms of the democratization process it divides the countries into three groups – advanced, intermediate, and slow. Then it measures the satisfaction of citizens where this is low but where it is perhaps counter-intuitive. In this case, although they are in the intermediate group, Romania and Bulgaria have the highest satisfaction rates. The conclusion is that if, according to Putnam, institutional performance is the only predictor of citizen satisfaction with democracy, then in Central and Eastern Europe the situation is more ambiguous.

The second section focuses on different levels of social capital in the region and its correlation with citizens' satisfaction with the democratic process. The level of social capital seems to be relatively high and the scores are not differentiated among particular countries. The correlation between these two variables is weaker than predicted by Putnam's model. The last part tests the relation of these phenomena with citizens' membership in organizations. The scores on the association index show very weak engagement in voluntary organizations but the difference between the highest and the lowest scores is not profound. Thus, the dependency between organizational affiliation, citizens' satisfaction and social capital is very weak. The section concludes that membership in voluntary organizations is not a main indicator of a truly democratic system.

In the concluding part of the paper, the author tries to explain some specific circumstances of Central and East Europe. Bulgaria and Romania may have the highest levels of citizen satisfaction while being in the intermediate group of democratic achievements because people tend to evaluate current regimes in relation to the non-democratic past. In these terms they can see the present as a significant achievement. The second conclusion relates to the contradiction between high levels (and the little differentiation between countries) of social capital and low level of economic performance. Again, this is explained in reference to the pre-1989 regimes when people created strong informal networks of trust, which continued after the demise of socialism. The final conclusion focuses on the relative unimportance of voluntary associations as a consequence of the socialist past when there was a negative attitude towards official institutions. The author argues that as membership in associations and the stocks of social capital were unrelated before 1989, they do not seem to influence each other in the transition. Although the stocks of social capital have been of crucial importance for the success of the political and economic reform, the levels of civic engagement do not directly reflect them. Any understanding of the process of democratization in Central and Eastern Europe must take into considerations the specificities of the region.

Although the paper is a valuable criticism of Putnam's theory's general applicability and argues for consideration of the region's historical and socio-cultural specificities, by in large, it is largely uncritical of the definitions and applicability of social capital.

### Holland, Jenny (1998) 'Does social capital matter?' *Institute for Development Studies Bulletin*, Vol. 29 (3), pp. 65–71

This article briefly describes a community development project in Southern Albania that was a part of the European Union sponsored LIEN/PHARE Program for integrated economic development. In the third section, the author presents her views on the effects of social capital on institutional and economic development. The picture painted of the Albanian context suggests, in a rather one-sided manner, the limited or negative social capital of the Albanians. The fourth section describes the project process. The author encountered a lack of trust by local people in the project as well as between themselves. The continual resistance to the project and the distrust to the project aims are attributed to this overall lack of trust. In the last section the author argues that the situation results from a history of 'a vicious circle of distrust, reinforcing a form of primitive social capital...'. Despite its limitations, this article is a useful case study of the actual life of social capital as experienced by developmental workers in a post-socialist country as well as of the complexity of misunderstandings between development and locals.

## Krzyszkowski, Jerzi (2000) 'Determinants of building social capital in Poland, the third sector for what and for whom', Conference Paper, *International Society for Third Sector Research, Fourth Conference*, Trinity College, Dublin, 5–8 July 2000

This paper presents a case study of the Lodz Administrative Region in Poland and analyses determinants of building social capital in Poland. The data is drawn from interviews with welfare managers and non-profit leaders, surveys of social workers and analysis of documents. The first section explores Polish research on localism as a strategy of counteracting poverty, NGOs as key actors in building social capital, and finally, social capital in families and neighbourhoods. The second part describes the case of Lodz where certain social assistance problems prevail. The author argues that public community social assistance is a bureaucratised institution that suffers from an excessive burden of administrative activity. Developing pluralism is a possible solution but the author points to the doubts whether the NGOs and private centres will maintain accessibility. Building social capital (activating the State and transferring social assistance to agents, setting up non-governmental-public partnerships, etc.) is seen as essential to coping with some of the recognised problems. This paper focuses on social capital as an aspect of successful collaboration between government, private and non-governmental institutions at local level. The author concludes that, together with financial support from central government, the legal framework for local partnership between public and social partners is the most important element in this process.

#### 3. ECONOMIC ACTIVITIES AND SOCIAL CAPITAL

### Kolankiewicz, George (1996) 'Social capital and social change', *British Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 47 (3), September, pp. 427–441

This article suggests that theories of social capital can provide useful insights into the post-socialist transition. The author calls for the creation of a robust sociological theory to explain developments after socialism and that this should be both sensitive to the past as well as to the specificities of each country. He sees such theory as a combination of classical theory and newly emerging theories of social capital. Although he finds some of Putnam's ideas useful, he sees Pierre Bourdieu as making the most significant contribution to social capital theory. In Bourdieu's view, social capital refers to networks and to the sum of resources or assets which accrue through the possession of a network of relationships. The author focuses on the Polish case but uses examples from other countries too.

Kolankiewicz explores how a redistributive mechanism created during socialism is transformed to one based on the market and, secondly, he examines the peculiarities of class formation in this context. The author argues that in order to understand how market situations are socially constructed in post-communist societies, it is necessary to understand the conversion process of social capital with its wide range of other capitals, i.e. political, financial, cultural/symbolic/informational, and organizational. When explaining how political positions or educational attainments can be transformed into economic assets, Kolankiewicz argues that both the individual and the systemic levels should be studied. Asset conversion is conditioned both by the origins of the means available and, secondly, the limiting conditions which structure the market situation.

The last section approaches the market as a network and explores the concept of trust. The author argues that generalised trust (as suggested by Putnam) has little importance in the asset conversion process due to the legacies of socialism where generalised trust was low.

In conclusion, Kolankiewicz argues that extensive network capital during socialism was prevalent for cultural as well as for structural reasons and it has been central to the emergence of new entrepreneurs. Class formation in the post-socialist societies should be seen in terms of how the utilisation of personal and public networks assisted in the conversion of capital assets.

### Neef, Rainer (2002) 'Aspects of the informal economy in a transforming country: the case of Romania', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, Vol. 26 (2), pp. 299–322

This article provides an excellent general analysis of the Romanian informal economy and, via several case studies, details its specific mechanisms. The author explores the main activities and working conditions of households engaged in informal economy in Romania between 1996 and 1998. The aim is to examine the extent to which mass poverty and decreasing formal employment are compensated by informal incomes. The interviews with people involved in the informal economy demonstrate the large scale and rising significance of this sector. The author considers organizational forms, working conditions, incomes, effects, and distribution of labour. Subsistence farming and occasional informal work dominate the informal field that is often characterized by its creativity and energy. Informal activities provide for both household survival and social security. However, in some particular branches of this economy and among some types of household structure, there are many who remain dependent and at the margins of subsistence. In other cases, albeit limited in number, informal activities can bring economic success and become formalized or simply co-exist with a formal job.

The household situation (income level and number of members) and the embeddedness of networks are important factors in the success of the informal economy. Cooperation between network partners is crucial to provide assistance and resources. The author provides a table that demonstrates how certain social and economic indicators combine to produces various types of informal income.

### Ledeneva, Alena V. (1998) Russia's economy of favour: blat, networking and informal exchange, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

This is the first published research that analyses *blat* as a social phenomenon with all its nuances, paradoxes and dynamics. The author sees *blat* (the use of personal networks and informal contacts to obtain scarce goods and services and to find ways around formal procedures) to be the core of the everyday post-Soviet life and she explores its effects in the post-socialist state. The social institutions that caused the expansion of *blat* are examined with skill and insight. The author describes in detail the ways these networks interweave with political and economic power and the ways people use them to pursue their interests. The central argument of the book is that *blat* should be considered as the reaction of people aiming to transform the structural constraints of socialist distribution into a more tolerable system. *Blat* is grounded in personal relationships and access to public resources. The author examines in detail how *blat* differs from and is similar to phenomena such as the 'second economy', 'black market', 'bribery', etc. As it has been a non-monetary relationship and has remained an important transaction even after the demise of socialism *Blat* is a potential obstacle to a money economy.

The study is based on long-term qualitative research (56 interviews and numerous discussions, participant observation, and life histories). Although the sample is neither representative, nor the data statistical, the author did try to verify the findings against several surveys. Moreover, the study provides an in-depth analysis of the principles of *blat* offering a vivid and compelling picture of its meanings, effects and scale. Chapter four focuses on the distribution of *blat* across society and the various types of people who use and don't use *blat*. This ethnography of *blat* among 'common people' is a perceptive account of social relationships and how exchange articulates private interests against the rigid controls or empty spaces left by the state.

## Hivon, Myriam (1998) 'The bullied farmer. Social pressure as a survival strategy?' in Sue Bridger and Frances Pine (eds.) Surviving post-socialism: gender, ethnicity and underclass in Eastern Europe and the former USSR, London: Routledge

This article explores how private farmers in Russia suffer violence and negative feelings from local communities, ordinary villagers and local governments. Villagers who have chosen to remain in state, collective farms and the rural enterprises organize community opposition against private farmers. This opposition is only partially explained through concepts of 'egalitarianism', 'envy' or a historical lack of a 'culture of private ownership'. The author argues that peasants have experience with private farming from socialist times but the new farming is different to the ones established after socialism. The inequalities introduced by government regulations concerning land use and ownership are the main reason for the collective actions against the private farmers. Villagers try to redistribute resources (land, technology and products) and gain management control by pressurizing private farmers. In turn, private farmers who found ways to cooperate with villagers demonstrate successful survival strategies themselves, while those who ignored villagers' resistance sustained significant losses in their farms. In this way, situations that reduce rural access to or control over essential resources are the main reasons for community protests as a survival mechanism.

CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES WORKING PAPER SERIES

### Sik, Endre and Barry Wellman (1999) 'Network capital in capitalist, communist and post communist countries', in Barry Wellman (ed.) *Networks in the global village. Life in contemporary communities*, Boulder: Westview, pp. 225–253

This article explores the different conditions for the development of network capital in the communist, post-communist and capitalist countries. The authors provide detailed accounts of the reasons for there being greater amounts of network capital in communism in contrast with capitalist countries, and the even greater levels during post-communism. While social networks are vital for cooperation, offering coping as well as grabbing opportunities, they play an important role in these spheres during socialist times. The authors explore the development of networks as substitutes for the state and market in the cases of household building, inter-household support, and among managers and their organizations. Further, they analyze network capital as superimposing upon the state and the market, providing examples from the academic labor market, and corruption in the market.

During post communism, network capital has become an addition (but not a substitute) to state and market. According to the authors, it has increased due to the uncertainty of economic actors (caused by rapidly changing legal frameworks, new political system, newly opened borders, increased unemployment and the new entrepreneurial elite). Post communism contains both threats and opportunities and people use networks as coping and grabbing strategies. Inter-household networks have become more efficient survival strategy. The networks thus knit are dense and foster collective work for the common good. Past or newly established networks among entrepreneurs are used to start or protect existing businesses. An illuminating example is that of the taxi-drivers in Budapest. The conclusion contains a perceptive summary of the importance of networks in Central and Eastern Europe linking it to the historical predominance of the rural population as well as to the larger contexts of market development and state structures.

### Raiser, Martin (1999) 'Trust in transition', European Bank for Reconstruction and Development Working paper 39

The paper contributes to the growing literature on the role of informal institutions in the transition and, in particular, business networks. It focuses on generalized trust as a key ingredient in the institutional infrastructure of a market economy. The author argues that entrepreneurship cannot flourish in an environment of distrust as many economic opportunities are closed off. The first part of the paper distinguishes between different forms of trust and concludes that bilateral trust is less important than generalized trust in a society, defined as social capital. Social capital facilitates the exchange of information and supports collective action. The second part examines the role of trust in transition and outlines the importance of the legacy of socialism in terms of distrust.

The author argues that business networks during post-socialism have mostly grown out of former bureaucratic bargaining relationships. As a result of their closure, trust is not sufficiently generalized to fully realize economic opportunities. The following section describes three types of trust in post-socialist societies: ascribed (within communities or groups), which is predominant; processed based (or 'loose networks'), which is slowly increasing; and global networks, which are predominant in Central Europe and thus have contributed to the faster economic growth of this sub region in comparison with the Eastern Europe. The author concludes that the lack of generalized trust is a key factor behind the disappointing economic performance of post-socialist countries.

The paper discusses some possible determinants of generalized trust such as changing moralities in a society (individualistic versus collectivist culture), distance between social groups or the level of homogeneity in a society, and thirdly, the risk of being cheated. However, the author argues that the most important determinant of generalized trust is the availability of complementary contract enforcement from the state. He argues that the relationship between state enforcement and trust is a

relationship of mutual dependency, in other words, enforcement guarantees trust and vice versa. Other related factors include: the importance of the goal of membership in the European Union which leads to the transformation of politicians' attitudes; the geographical and cultural proximity to the West; the exposure to Western trading partners, where the trust of foreign partners has to be won; liberalization of the market and the state system; and the development of a national rather than an ethnic culture.

One of the achievements of the paper is the recognition of the important role of public policy in the process of democratization and economic development. However, the author limits his analysis to the role of moral leadership, third-party enforcement, and the support for the formation of new networks. The turnover of the elite in government is seen as a positive feature (e.g. in Poland) against the more stable elite (e.g. in Russia). Policies that enhance the country's exposure to the discipline of foreign markets are recommended despite the recognition that in some cases these can be counter productive for the larger society. The focus on personalities and different structural legacies is seen as clearly too narrow. Public policies can contribute to building generalized trust through constitutional safeguards, distribution policies and direct policy intervention to strengthen business networks and facilitate the exchange of information.

### Brown, David and Laszlo Kulcsar (2001) 'Household economic behaviour in post-socialist rural Hungary', *Rural Sociology*, Vol. 66 (2), pp. 157–180

This article examines household economic behaviour in post-socialist Hungary. The survey of 751 selected households in three rural areas demonstrates a weak labour force with a heavy reliance on state welfare programs. Both inter-household exchanges and self-provisioning play a very important role as coping strategies in the context of the rural economic crisis. Inter-household exchange is not only economically but also socially motivated. The author's found that the better-off households with more economic and social resources are involved in more inter-household exchanges. The authors conceptualise household economic behaviour and examine in particular the non-market aspects of household economic behaviour (self-provisioning and producing for inter-household exchange). Inter-household exchange is seen as major 'livelihood strategy' and a means of community reproduction in Hungary. The findings prove that rural households are embedded in a cultural system that structures non-market economic activities. Non-market economic activity has important unbroken historical continuity and remains an institution of village social life. The objectives of such exchanges are to strengthen social networks and community structures. The authors continue their research into the 'supply' and 'demand' of exchange networks and the meaning and scale of reciprocity.

### Sik, Endre and Claire Wallace (2000) 'The development of open-air markets in East-Central Europe', *Journal of Urban and Regional Studies*, Vol. 23 (4), pp. 697–714

This article is the introduction to a special volume of Urban and Regional Studies devoted to trading in the post-communist world. It describes the open-air markets after socialism as a particular form of trading activity that provides insights into contemporary market relations. The authors offer a critical overview of theories of open-air markets and explore the structural changes which have affected their development, for example, the dissolution of the previous retail sector and bilateral trading agreements between countries, the re-opening of borders, the growth of consumer culture, decreases in the standard of living, and weak state structures. The authors argue that useful comparisons could be made across the region and between different historical contexts but also at a worldwide level. In recent years, a significant body of literature of small-scale trading and market activities has emerged.

The contribution of this research to the sociological debates is that the authors provide a rigorous analysis the covers a range of conceptual issues: the formal and informal aspects of open-air markets; the role of ethnic groups; the changing morality of these markets; the embeddedness of economic relations and the role of social capital (in the sense of investment in relationships to supplement or substitute financial capital). The authors argue that too much informalization will stifle trading activities, replacing the free play of supply and demand by obligations to relatives and friends. The role of ethnic groups is one of providing an environment where informal sets of rules are observed parallel to the lack of formal structures, norms and rules. Thus, social capital and belonging to an ethnic collective provide security in a risky environment. However, the authors also describe the negative aspects of closed networks or being the Other in the trading context.

### Lawson, Colin W. and Douglas K. Saltmarshe (2002) 'The psychology of economic transformation: the impact of the market on social institutions, status and values in a northern Albanian village', *Journal of Economic Psychology*, Vol. 23 (4), pp. 487–500

This article addresses the effects of post-communist changes on social relationship, economic opportunities, status assessments and values in a northern Albanian village. The paper offers insights into the weakening role of the household head and the declining importance of clans in interhousehold economic cooperation. This article is an excellent example of how economic interests may affect social relations in complex ways and not simply by strengthening or weakening ties. In the Albanian community, respect is gained through public behavior such as showing willingness to contribute financially or otherwise to other households and social activities, especially those of the clan (the extended family). Families that do not contribute out of reasons of choice or poverty are not respected. At the same time, the household (the immediate family) is identified as the center of economic activity and the increasing importance of household independence from the extended family is growing. Economic differentiation is reducing the importance of the clan and in the market system, employing clan members can cost more than employing outsiders. This has created difficulties for clan members if they are involved in independent commercial activity. At the same time the clan retains important social functions - a pool of networks for finding information, jobs, marriage partners, etc. For that reason a successful businessman who retains independence from the clan in his daily business would contribute lavishly at clan weddings or other ceremonies. This can be seen as 'buying off his distance' while preserving respect and the chance to draw on the clan in times of need.

In the context of a lack of formal state structures the most important continuing function of the clan is the provision of security. This clan loyalty at all costs results in ambivalent attitudes towards corrupt, illegal and unjust behavior. The authors conclude that the lack of adequate formal and informal institutions to address security creates a certain degree of anomie in the villages.

## Wallace, Claire, Oksana Shmulyar and Vasil Bedzar (1999) 'Investing in social capital: the case of small-scale, cross-border traders in post-communist Europe', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Studies*, Vol. 23 (4) 751–770

This article provides one of the best analysis of small scale cross border trading in Central Europe. The focus is on how people create, maintain or drop out of networks. The introduction provides an insightful theoretical introduction into the moral economy of trade to demonstrate how a central element of this type of trade is risk. The authors argue that research has not adequately addressed how groups and networks are constructed and reconstructed in carrying out such economic activities. The aim of the article is to demonstrate how social, ethnic and family ties are invoked in the course of managing small-scale informal trading. The major hypothesis is that the extent of moral obligation or

the kind of moral ties developed during post-communism can affect the type of capitalism that develops in the region. Building on that, the authors examine two hypothesis: first, that family networks, ethnic solidarity and friendship would be used for securing trust and secondly, that a wider group (weak ties) will be used by the traders to avoid too much solidarity with dense networks which reduces profit.

The findings on the forms and mechanisms of small-scale trading networks and the numerous risks involved, demonstrate that there are different degrees in which each of the hypotheses will predominate. Small traders develop their own systems of protection and control. Strong and weak ties take various forms and play different roles – from reciprocity to a patron-client relationship. Networks can inhibit market activity. The strongest ties of obligation and support exist in the bounded family group that consists of parents, children and grandparents. Outside this group, weak ties are built on reciprocity, mutual favors, or patronage. They are not impersonal but are based on a calculable form of exchange and render the environment more predictable. Economic activity in post-socialist societies is seen as socially embedded in informal settings where networks are developed out of contacts and reinforced through family or ethnic ties.

### Swain, Nigel (2000) 'The rural transition in post-socialist Central Europe and the Balkans', Working paper No. 9, Halle: Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology

This paper presents the results of a series of research projects of the University of Liverpool's Centre for Central and Eastern Europe in the mid-1990s. Both qualitative and quantitative data were gathered on villages in different regions in Central and East Europe. The findings throw light on the importance of social and cultural capital; on the process of agricultural restructuring, rural employment and rural entrepreneurs; on the role of local politics and local authorities in rural regeneration and on the paradoxes of post-socialist agricultural politics.

One of the most important elements in the rural transformation processes was found to be social and cultural capital. Eleven factors identified during the research (that determined the survival or demise of the co-operatives) are interpreted as dimensions of social and cultural capital. For a rural entrepreneur these mattered in terms of providing access to machinery and contacts with markets and sources of finance. Except for those few who were successful in the second economy during socialism, only the management of the previous socialist institutions were in a strong position to become commercial private farmers in post-socialist villages.

The results of this research have implications for the sociological and anthropological theories of transition in that they prove that the social and cultural capital acquired from activity during socialism (more than the inherited from of rich or powerful parents) is a primary determinant of economic success in the private agricultural businesses. Another significant finding is that there were windows of opportunity for those with less accumulated social capital in a well developed formal state structure and legislation (e.g. in Hungary). No new farmers have succeeded after the success in the first round and the existing farmers have strengthened their positions. The post-socialist paradox found by the authors is that the more government resources are directed towards private large-scale farmers the more they antagonize other rural interests that depend on agriculture for their livelihoods. Peasants have demonstrated to defend a way of life based on dependence on agriculture. The recommendation for policy making is to consider this dualism of agriculture and differentiate support for small and large-scale farming accordingly.

#### 4. EDUCATION AND SOCIAL CAPITAL

#### Wong, Raymond Sin-Kwok (1998) 'Multidimensional influences of family environment in education: the case of Czechoslovakia', *Sociology of Education*, Vol. 71 (1), pp. 1–22

This article combines several theoretical approaches including Coleman's intergenerational conversion process, social network theory, and Bourdieu's cultural capital theory. The authors identify four elements of family capital that play an important role in children's educational attainment: human capital, financial capital, social capital and cultural capital. Social capital is seen as a very significant factor including social relationships and networks outside but accessible by the family. The case study of educational inequality in socialist Czechoslovakia shows that the Communist Party was an active agent in producing intergenerational inequality. The political institutions were critical in educational attainment.

## Orazem, Peter F. and Milan Vodopivec (1994) 'Winners and losers in transition. Returns to education, experience and gender in Slovenia', *Policy Research Working Paper 1342*, World Bank, Policy Research Department, Transition Economics Division

This paper explores the trajectories of 'winners' and 'losers' in the economic transition from 1987 to 1991. The findings suggest that relative wages and employment rose for the most educated and fell for the least educated. Early pension plans reduced the supply of very experienced workers while it did not open opportunities for the youngest workers but for those just under pensionable age. Increasing returns to education and experience contributed to wage inequality. The Slovenian case has shown decreasing returns for education and experience. It was also found that as regards incomes and employment, women gained more than men, the reasons being that women tend to occupy sectors that were less adversely affected by the transition.

## Webber, Stephen and Ilkka Liikanen (eds.) (2001) *Education and civic culture in post-communist countries*, Basingstoke: Palgrave in association with School of Slavonic and East European Studies, University College London

This is one of the most useful volumes to explore the problems of education in the post-communist states. It is the result of a conference organized by two research networks in 1998: the Forum for the Study of Civic Culture in Russia and the Baltic Sea region and the Study Group on Education in Russia, the independent States and Eastern Europe. It is unfortunate that most of the papers focus on Russia and post-Soviet republics; there is only one chapter on Hungary and one on the Czech Republic. However, the volume does not suffer too much as all the themes are relevant to educational reforms in other countries and could be utilized in larger comparative frameworks.

The main aim of the volume is to analyze the role that education plays in influencing patterns of social relations in post-socialist countries. The authors further not only understanding of education through their examination of civic activity, civic culture and the preconditions for collective action in post-communist societies, they also address recent debates in the study of democracy and political culture in these societies. The main question addressed is what do trends in the development of education systems tell us about broader patterns of social, political and economic change in post-communist context? Are the reforms, which are often seen as diminishing the role of the state, advancing the formation of a Western type 'civil society'? To what extent are the post-socialist

societies similar or different and to what extent are the recent changes in Western education systems relevant for this context?

The book is organized into four parts: reviving civic culture; nationalism reframed; identity matters; towards a brighter future. The first chapter is the strongest contribution to understanding civic education, social networks and collective action in Russia. It demonstrates that the claims that civil society in Russia is weak is a misreading of what is, in practice, a relatively effective social organization that exists in the context of limited governmental effectiveness. Teachers in Russia create inward oriented networks as a survival strategy. The authors argue that democratic development and an increase in the effectiveness of the state would reinforce integration through organized interest struggle. A further increase in ineffectiveness could accentuate the importance of the mutual trust networks.

## Hanley, Eric and Matthew McKeever (1997) 'The persistence of educational inequalities in state-socialist Hungary: trajectory maintenance versus counter selection', *Sociology of Education*, Vol. 70 (1), pp. 1–18

This article offers a critique of the theory of counter selection and the recommendation that quotas reduce educational inequalities. Instead, the authors demonstrate convincingly how social groups maintain intergenerational social status and, thus, provide support for the theory of trajectory maintenance. Despite the fact that they generally improved the educational situation in Eastern Europe, socialist regimes reproduced significant inequalities through the educational system and especially regarding access to higher education. The article provides a critical and comprehensive review of literature on education in Hungary, scrutinised statistics and data that have been previously taken for granted. As a result of the accumulation of reliable data, the authors challenge the view that the class composition of high schools and universities was radically altered after socialism.

Class based persistent inequalities stem from the two resources available for those of professional and administrative origin: cultural and social capital (meaning social connections). Cultural capital was vested in the professional class while social capital, mainly in the administrative one. Thus, the authors conclude that the persistent inequalities in education are related to unequal distribution of cultural and social capital. Children of professionals are more likely to advance in tertiary education than children of administrators. However, the authors do recognize the need for further research admitting that in the data on which this study was conducted, there is no reliable measure for social capital.

### Tomusk, Voldemar (2000) 'Reproductions of the 'state nobility' in Eastern Europe: past patterns and new practices', *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, Vol. 21 (2) pp. 269–283

This article is an excellent contribution to the discussion of the emerging patterns of elite reproduction in Eastern Europe, and particularly in the ex-Soviet Union republics. The introduction and the first section outline the theoretical premises developed by Bourdieu. The author argues, after Bourdieu, that the educational system legitimizes power. The following section explores, in a very evocative way, how the communist regime used education to legitimize itself and how it reproduced its nomenklatura despite the professed egalitarianism of education. The communist elite came from the vocational sector (people trained as technocrats). Close ties were established between state and businesses. The formation of capital during socialism followed a different pattern to that described by Bourdieu: accumulation of capital along the family lines was avoided sometimes through political terror and affirmative action. The official policy was that of a democratic education in its extreme –

awarding with a higher education status those who displayed political loyalty. In this way, only a state engineered elite could form.

With the demise of socialism, privatization helped recreate the old elite into a new one. The new educational institutions (in competition with the old institutions of education for attracting the elite) in Eastern Europe are all oriented to fee-paying students and promote education that 'meets Western standards'. While the old elite preferred the field of engineering during socialism, they now prefer law and business studies. Competition for the monopoly of elite reproduction is seen to be eroding the state further: the international funding agencies are attracted to fund this new legitimization process. This, at times, overly emotional paper, is a useful general overview of elite reproduction through education.

#### Tooley, James (2001) 'Privatization of education Albania style', Economic Affairs, Vol. 23 (1), p. 54

This short article provides a case study of a state school in Tirana that was revived after 1992 through American funding. Many of its experienced teachers had left for better-paid jobs. The director was unable to negotiate a public-private partnership with the government and, in 2000, the school was transformed into a private one. The school fees are USD800 per year – more than most families can afford. The article compliments the director for allowing the children from poor families to enrol if they past the entrance test. However, it becomes clear that these students will have to work for the school (on administrative or maintenance tasks or in the school businesses) after graduation to compensate for their fees with all the potential risk of reinforcing inequalities. However, for some students it is a chance to fulfil their potential and start their own businesses, which may in turn, support other poorer students. Some students have already opened snack bars, shops and bookshops employing students.

### Lisovskaya, Elena and Vyacheslav Karpov (2001) 'The perplexed world of Russian private schools: findings from field research', *Comparative Education*, Vol. 37 (1), pp. 34–64

This paper is a valuable contribution to education studies in Eastern Europe. It provides insights into the little known development of private schools – a new type of institution in the post-communist world. It focuses on the routine practices and social connections within the schools. The data is drawn from in-depth interviews, observations and analysis of documents. The results suggest that in contemporary Russia, the term 'private school' denotes a variety of institutions of which only some are genuinely independent while others are firmly linked to governmental or business structures through networks of formal and informal connections.

This research builds upon other literature on the process of educational transition in the context of political democratization. Its particular contribution lies in the view of the schools 'from the inside' in contrast to the majority of research on educational reforms in Central and Eastern Europe that focus on macro-level changes and the generally unfavourable socio-economic context. Its methods reveal significant strategies employed by the private schools in conditions of legal indeterminacy, normative uncertainty and hardship. These strategies involve the application of informal social norms and rules, originating either in the past, or from more recent times. Many schools engage in the dual economy, transactions may be based on informal connections, barter exchanges (of goods and services) with city officials and other interested groups take place, and cash flows may not be properly accounted for in tax reports.

The case study material is particularly rich in detail. Informal networking has become a major strategy for survival. The following section focuses on various types of private schools: ethnic, religious, elite, and schools for disabled. Some of the data suggests that the better the schools are

networked with external funding bodies the more accessible they are (requiring less or no fees such as the Jewish school). One section is devoted to the state-schools that are gradually becoming indistinguishable from private schools in that they require services from the parents (paid or barter). Other schools that are free have become institutions of the poor. Thus, the authors argue that the informal norms of micro-level institutional management are more important than macro-level government reform policies. The authors suggest that these norms may crystallize into organizational forms that will have a profound impact upon the future Russian educational scene. In particular, some schools may be formally private and independent while in reality they are heavily dependent on the elite and the manipulation of public resources.

## Hagan, John, Hans Merkens and Klaus Boehnke (1995) 'Delinquency and disdain: social capital and the control of right-wing extremism among East and West Berlin youth', *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 100 (4) January, pp. 1028–1051

This article focuses on the importance of social control and the formation of social capital in restraining East and West Berlin youth from involvement in delinquency and right-wing extremism. It explores various theoretical approaches to delinquency and disdain as well as the sociology of deviant political beliefs. The authors see the process of informal social control as processes of social capital that can protect youth from drifting into deviance and disorder during important transitional phases such as adolescence. The research draws on comparisons between school performances and parental control between East and West Berlin.

These indicators are linked to differences in the micro and macro level formation of social capital. The survey was conducted with 489 students between 1991–1992. More parental control and more self-reported school success were found in East German families, and this was seen as having more restraining role. However, anomic aspirations are found to be higher in Eastern Germany due to unrestrained 'wealth wish', repression and deprivation. School achievement was found to be more salient than parental control in explaining differences between East and West Berlin. This is suggested as an important consideration in the school reforms in East Germany. The paper is a contribution to the sociology of crime and deviance in outlining the importance of context (in terms of both timing and location). However, it leaves out other important issues such as the school-parent relations and is more of a snap shot than an in-depth view of life chances in East and West Berlin.

### Lonkila, Markku (1998) 'The social meaning of work: aspects of the teaching profession in post-Soviet Russia', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 50 (4), pp. 699–712

This article aims to explain the significant difference in the number of workplace mediated social relations between Russians (48%) and Finns (28%). The study is based on comparative qualitative data concerning the social networks of secondary school teachers collected in St. Petersburg and in Helsinki. (1993–1994). Although this paper mainly describes the Russian situation and only gives an occasional comparison with the Finnish case (perhaps due to a lack of space) it is an excellent example of studying the social importance of networks in the educational system. The author traces the career paths, the teacher-pupil relations, the relations between the colleagues, the complexity of careers, teaching as a means of social mobility, and the shifting borders of the professional sphere. The author describes how informal exchange in Russian schools is not only more frequent but also qualitatively different from those in Finland. In Russia, one's position at work is often used for mutually beneficial arrangements. The collegial, teacher-pupil and pupil-parent relations significantly affect each other. The work-mediated relations cross the physical boundaries at school, facilitating the mixing of professional and non-professional spheres. An example is given, in which one pupils' bad behaviour is

overlooked because the teacher receives medical care in the clinic where the pupil's doctor-mother works.

The author concludes that the greater number of teachers, pupils and parents of pupils in the Russian networks (than in the Finnish) may be indicative of the weakness of the professional sphere and of its mixing with other spheres as a compensation. The findings suggest that work is more important for the Russian teachers as a social milieu providing an arena for socializing, childcare and access to informal resources. Together with their geographically condensed social networks this Russian case study highlights some of the strengths of the social patterns inherited from the Soviet era. This may show that people in everyday socialist life were not passive but actively transformed the socialist context and continue to mould the transition today.

### Sayer, John (ed.) (2002) Opening windows to change. A case study of sustained international development, Oxford Studies in Comparative Education, Vol. 11, Oxford: Symposium Books

This first chapter of this volume, 'TEMPUS in Perm' by John Sayer and Andrei Kolesnikov, provides a reflective post-project evaluation and review of the EU TEMPUS-TACIS project in Perm, Russia. The TEMPUS Program (Trans-European Mobility Program for University Studies) started in 1990. It was the first part of the PHARE technical aid program for the countries of Central and East European after the collapse of the socialist system. In the post-Soviet countries, its equivalent is TACIS. TEMPUS is the EU instrument for developing and restructuring higher education in both PHARE and TACIS countries. It is based on the model of the EU ERASMUS program (European Action Scheme for the mobility of European Students).

The prime objective of this project was to support the Pedagogical University in Perm by ensuring the continued training of teachers for children with special educational needs. This required creating a partnership between the region, city, specialized services and the schools, the teachers and the families. It involved university restructuring, re-skilling and reprogramming to support educational service and meet some of the needs of the community.

The exchange of teachers between countries was very fruitful: there was a joint survey work and 'action research' consultancies. These helped develop shared understandings, address teacher attitudes, motivations, and values as well as bringing together both individual and project aspirations. The role of EU partners was significant for staff, organizational and resource development, on the management of change and exchange of good practice in helping children with learning disabilities.

The paper outlines several problems that the project faced. The most significant was the difficult economic situation in Russia, which affected all spheres of education. This is where the high level of interpersonal trust between the different partner's representatives was very important. Among the achievements of the project, the most important one is the 'external restructuring' in the working relationship between the university, the public authorities and local schools. The University began to raise funds locally and this improved its relationship with the city and increased the involvement of the city and the region. As a result the city has clarified its policy for inclusion of special educational needs in the mainstream schools.

## Stovel, Laura (2000) 'Confronting ethnic chauvinism in a post-war environment: NGOs and peace education in Bosnia', *Working paper 7*, Centre for Conflict Resolution, Department of Peace Studies, University of Bradford

This report is an extremely rigorous analysis comparing post-war educational programs in Bosnia and Croatia. The main focus is Bosnia. It begins within a theoretical section which explores how theories on racism and ethnic chauvinism converge and diverge. The aim is to find an appropriate

methodological technique to look at the situation in Bosnia and Croatia. The second chapter discusses those NGO education programs in the two countries which aim to link children from different ethnic backgrounds. The last chapter, on trauma, identity and reconciliation, presents possible solutions to loosen enemy bonds through education. The first appendix reviews methodologies aimed at improving ethnic relationships and challenging ethnic chauvinism. The second appendix is a brief but useful overview of al projects reviewed.

The aim of the report is to understand how NGO programs challenge ethnic chauvinism. The results show that although chauvinism is challenged as an attitude it will most likely persist so long as ethnic nationalism is embedded in institutional and social structures. The author discusses why some efforts to provide links between children of different ethnic groups failed. Education officials did not cooperate. Programs of active learning were installed instead. Other strategies included intercommunity mixing and communication: teachers, students and parents had to participate in joint decision making in order to receive material assistance. More successful were the efforts to bring youth together for common projects. Some multiethnic conferences of activists from both communities were important venues to meet and share ideas, form alliances and break the feelings of isolation. In Croatia there is more education on tolerance than there is in Bosnia. This is explained with the lack of fear of a new conflict in Croatia where it is politically safe to discuss tolerance.

The author argues that efforts that deal with trauma must be dynamic and individually specific as there are different stages in the process of trauma that must be addressed differently: depression, aggression, revenge, etc. It is crucial that people from different communities see each other as human beings through sharing experiences, commonalities and acknowledging each other's pain and loss. This process of re-humanization is the prerequisite for a healing process. A deeper understanding of how chauvinism works should follow this. The third stage must involve reexamining institutional systems and the ways of thinking that inhibit dialogue.

### Phillips, David and Michael Kaser (1992) Education and economic change in Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union, Oxford Studies in Comparative Education, Vol. 2, Willingford: Triangle Books

This volume is a useful collective work on the restructuring of education in the post-socialist countries. It compares different Eastern European countries and the Former Soviet Union. There are chapters on Poland, Hungary, Czechoslovakia, Romania, and a separate one on Transylvania, Germany, and Former Soviet Union. Some of the issues discussed include the socialist legacies and their effects, autonomy and political power, religious education, education and nationalism, vocational education, civic education, language and education, the possibilities of influencing the socio-economic processes through education, and the role of the state in education. This informative volume is an important starting point for research on post-communist education. It contains numerous facts on the actual restructuring of the educational systems, initial lessons from the implemented changes and analyses of legacies of the previous regimes. For more recent issues in the problems and successes of educational systems in Central and Eastern Europe, the reports by the European Union, UNDP and the World Bank are useful reference points.

CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES WORKING PAPER SERIES

#### 5. HEALTH AND SOCIAL CAPITAL

### World Health Organisation (1995) 'Investing in women's health: Central and Eastern Europe', WHO Regional Publications, European Series, No. 55

This publication is based on reports about women's health in 11 countries following the WHO Investing in Women's Health initiative. As described by the WHO Director for Europe, the initiative explores ways to encourage politicians to cooperate with people in arenas of public health and public policy by building and using networks to improve the health of women in Europe. The preface of the report describes the Initiative and its main concepts. Under the section 'Social epidemiology', three issues are taken to reflect the reality of women's health in Central and Eastern Europe: emergency, security (versus violence), and choice (versus lack of education and other factors creating disadvantages).

The data on mortality in the first chapter is used for comparison across Europe for lack of other suitable data. Mortality data for Central and Eastern Europe show that the rates in these countries are higher than in the rest of Europe. The second chapter discusses women's positions in the social structure and the differential impact of the economic crisis. The third chapter outlines the framework of daily life and how cultural and structural opportunities and barriers shape daily living. The fourth chapter focuses on the environment and the impact of dangerous and deteriorating conditions. The last chapter outlines future directions, arguing for effective solutions to build up security and ensure choices in women's daily lives. The priorities for action section argues that more research is necessary for effective policies and programs to be build. The main argument is that effective investment in policies and programs has to address the needs of women as they live their daily lives.

### Reitan, Therese C. (2003) 'Too sick to vote? Public health and voter turnout in Russia during the 1990s', *Communist and post-communist studies*, 36 (1) March, pp. 49–68

This article contributes to debates on the determinants of political participation and electoral turnout. Socio-economic resources, education, income and occupation have all been held to be significant markers of political participation. The article argues that public health is another factor which can be considered as an important social and political resource at the aggregate level. The authors examine regional data on life expectancy and electoral turnout in Russia. The analysis does not provide a causal link between the two but there are positive correlations between the two that suggest a link. Regions with relatively higher life expectancy are more likely to produce higher turnout at elections. Life expectancy may be a marker of other measures such as income and regional prosperity but public health may also be used as a significant marker in its own right.

#### Kennedy, Bruce P., Ichiro Kawachi and Elizabeth Brainero (1998) 'The role of social capital in the Russian mortality crisis', *World Development*, Vol. 26 (11), pp. 2029–2043

This article addresses the epidemiologists' debate on the impact of social cohesion, in terms of social networks and interpersonal trust, on health. The authors used a household survey data from the All-Russian Centre for Public Opinion research and the 1996 Demographic Yearbook of Russia. Based on these, they found associations between indicators of social capital (mistrust in government, crime, quality of work relations, civic engagement in politics) and life expectancy and morality rates. They argue that the notion that social cohesion enhances well being is by now a well established fact: socially isolated people die at two to three times the rate of well-connected people due to limited

resources and various forms of support. Trust in local government, regional and city's economic situation were found to matter more than national parameters and the authors suggest that local social context is more important to health than the national economic and social contexts. A plausible suggestion is that structural regional differences in mortality that were already present in the 1980s have persisted until today. The final conclusion (built more on the results of the Russian Barometer Studies than on their own study) suggests that distrust in government translates in a poorer voter turnaround and disinterest in politics. As this in turn weakens good governance, this will ultimately prove costly in terms of ill health and diminished quality of life.

# Bobak, Martin, Hynek Pikhart, Richard Rose, Clyde Hertzman, Michael Marmot (2000) 'Socioeconomic factors, material inequalities, and perceived control in self-rated health: cross-sectional data from seven post-communist countries', *Social Science and Medicine*, Vol. 51, pp. 1343–1350

This paper examines the contribution that deprivation, educational attainment, perceived control and national economic inequality have with respect to self-rated health in seven countries in Central and Eastern Europe (Russia, Estonia, Lithuania, Latvia, Hungary, Poland, Czech Republic). The results suggest that, in a pattern that is similar to Western populations, education and material deprivations are strongly related to self-rated health.

### Balabanova, Dina and Martin McKee (2002) 'Understanding informal payments for health care: the example of Bulgaria', *Health Policy*, Vol. 62, pp. 243–273

This paper makes a solid contribution to current understandings of the health care system in Bulgaria (and thus in other post socialist countries). The authors explore the issue of informal payments for health care. The findings result from triangulated information collected through a combination of qualitative and quantitative approaches. The aim was to estimate the scale and determinants of informal payments and identify those who benefit, the characteristics and timing of payments and the reasons for paying. The findings suggest that informal payments are relatively common and, in some spheres of health care, are universal. The authors demonstrate how with the end of socialism informal payments increased at the same time as they became less affordable. An in-depth analysis of the reasons for payments shows that they emerge from socio-economic conditions rather than because of any supposedly cultural or traditional reasons. The authors argue that health care reform should address informal payments and suggest some start-up transformations that could reduce their prevalence. This paper is an example of high quality research that can produce reliable data on the informal economy as well as policy solutions which can help increase the accessibility of public services.

### Carlson, Per (1998) 'Self-perceived health in East and West Europe: another European health divide', *Social Science and Medicine*, Vol. 46, pp. 1355–1366

This paper explores differences in health between Western and Eastern Europe. The author argues that in order to examine these differences it is necessary to establish a framework that focuses on more than the medical care system and lifestyle. The main question is that if differences do exist, are they caused by the specific economic and socio-political conditions after 1989? Twenty-five countries were examined to investigate the circumstances of people's self-perceived health. The results suggest that participation in civic activities has a positive effect on health. Countries with a higher degree of membership in non-political associations tend to have a better-perceived health. Western countries (and especially the Nordic ones) have high numbers of people who are members of organizations.

While life-control was found to be important for self-perceived health, yet people in Eastern Europe perceived that they have less life-control. Those interested in politics tend to perceive their health better and here there was no noticeable divide between East and West. Economic satisfaction, which was at lower levels in Eastern Europe, was the most powerful predictor of self-perceived health.

The authors conclude that, in spite of its limitations, their research indicates that improving public health in East Europe might be facilitated by improving household economies, through individuals achieving more control over their everyday lives and by the strengthening of civil society. The latter is seen both as individual resource in situations of hardship and as a source of power to balance market forces. In this sense, studies that focus solely on individual behaviours such as smoking or drinking alcohol or on supply of medical services could be considered as one sided or too limited.

## Jones, Lynne (2002) 'Adolescent understandings of political violence and psychological violence and psychological well-being: a qualitative study from Bosnia Herzegovina', *Social Science and Medicine*, Vol. 55, pp. 1351–1371

This is an ethnographic exploration of how adolescents understand war. The qualitative approach provided an in-depth research into meaning and significance. Searching for meaning appeared to be associated with sensitivity to the political environment and feelings of insecurity about the prospect of a future war. The case studies presented demonstrate the vulnerability of adolescents when searching for meaning. Those who were disengaged tended to avoid contradictions and as a result maintained better psychological health. Local context had an important effect in mediating the manner in which engagement and disengagement occurred. The author suggests that political engagement may be protective in low-level conflicts where there is a possibility for action. When there is little opportunity for active engagement, the search for meaning has a different effect. However, disengagement also leads to an unquestioning acceptance of ethnic separatism.

The paper raises questions about the relationship between political understanding and psychological well-being. Adolescents recognized that their recovery was intimately bound with the recovery of the social and political communities in which they lived. The study provides an insight into the entire complexity of the society, including the long-term effects of political violence. It suggests that programs directed at social problems such as reforming the economy, integrating and modernizing the educational system, political initiatives such as arrests of war criminals, anticorruption measures, and protection of refugees will have as profound an impact on psychological well being as those focused on individual psychological recovery.

## O'Brien, David J., Valeri V. Patsiorkovski, Larry Dershem and Oksana Lylova (1996) 'Social capital and adaptation to social change in Russian villages', *Studies in Public Policy, Working paper No. 263*, Glasgow: University of Strathclyde,

This study is based on three joint Russian-American household surveys (1991, 1993, and 1995). It examines the ways in which household structure, social networks and community integration are associated with different levels of economic success and mental health in Post-Soviet Russia. The theoretical framework draws on research by Granovetter and Coleman that suggests that social relationships can have a positive impact on economic success () with concomitant positive effects on mental health.

The authors argue that the Soviet system restricted development of social capital and restricted its differential effects on the relative success of different households. In post-socialism, the restrictions of social capital do not exist but the social services have been reduced. The researchers examined the

networks of households (household structure, networks on which one depends in various areas of life, the extent to which households are integrated into the larger village community), their income and mental health (through symptoms of depression). Previous research is confirmed in the finding that an increase of number of relatives in the household (or living nearby) is strongly associated with an increase of total network capital.

Extended families are positively associated with economic growth and people living alone or single parents are disadvantaged. A larger percentage of kin in the helping networks is associated with lower depression scores but it is unrelated to economic growth. An important finding shows that the total number of ties in all helping networks has a positive association with mental health as well as economic success. The general conclusion is that households with more social capital (that is: number of household members, social networks, community integration) have more economic success and better psychological adjustment to the stress of transition.

### Wroblewska, Wikoria (2002) 'Women's status in Poland in the transition to a market economy', *Social Science and Medicine*, Vol. 54, pp. 707–726

This study examines the impact of the new socio-economic conditions on women's' health. The study uses the 1996 Health Survey of 20,000 women. The focus is on educational level, (un) employment, living conditions, marital status, smoking and life style. The study found health inequalities between men and women in Poland based on life expectancy, chronic disease and self-assessment. Some of these could be attributed to the difficult socio-economic situation. Those who are poor are more likely to assess their health as less than good, to suffer from respiratory and circulatory system's diseases and report neurotic problems. The paper highlights the importance of social support and networks in older age. It was found that loneliness in old age, albeit defined on the basis of living in a one-person household, is negatively correlated with health status.

### Rose, Richard (2001) 'The impact of social capital on health', *Studies in Public Policy, Working paper No. 358*, Glasgow: University of Strathclyde

This paper discusses a range of social influences on health in Russia. It is part of the broader literature that examines the influence of social cohesion and social support on individual health. Here, the focus is on social capital in the form of networks. The aim is to determine to what extent the health of Russians depends on their inclusion or exclusion from formal and/or informal networks rather than on conventional human capital influences, such as education or income. The first part of the paper reviews theories on social capital; trust in formal organizations, and the relationships between formal and informal organizations. Further, the author considers the specific Russian context and summarizes the survey methods for this particular project.

Russians are found to be turning towards informal networks in the context of non-functioning modern formal organizations. There are three hypothesis of the research and the last one is a combination of the first two: both human (age, education, etc.) and social capital (networks) are prime determinants of individual health. The results show that household income has a positive influence on health, but education was not found to be so significant. People who rely on networks (independent of whether these are 'modern' or 'pre-modern') are also in better health. Trust was significantly associated with physical and emotional health but its interpretation is warned as problematic. Most indicators of social integration (e.g. membership in organizations) consistently fail to appear as significant influences on health.

In the view of the author, the composite hypothesis of human and social capital emphasizes the incompleteness of an approach to health that is limited to socially significant attributes of individuals.

▼ CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES WORKING PAPER SERIES

The cumulative effect of social capital on physical health is found to be substantial. The last part of the paper explores broader implications of the research findings and provides a comparison between Russia, the Czech Republic and Korea. Russian society is seen as permeated with interdependencies between modern, anti-modern and pre-modern activities. These are both within households and within formal organizations of the polity and the economy. The author concludes by suggesting that further research should provide more comparisons and an understanding of the effects of various factors that influence social capital and health.

#### 6. INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE AND SOCIAL CAPITAL

Verdery, Katherine (1998) 'Property and power in Transylvania's decollectivization' in Chris Hann (ed.) *Property relations. Renewing the anthropological tradition*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 160–180

This chapter offers an insightful account of the transformations of property relations and their institutions in a Transylvanian village. The author provides a sound analysis of past and present local institutions and their changes drawing on qualitative data collected through many years of participant observation (since 1970s). The findings demonstrate that since communist times the local elite has been able to maintain its power as leaders of post-collective farms and local councils. The author shows that popular opinion is often against the introduction of exclusive property rights because they would lead to the transformation of collectively accumulated resources into private hands. The author argues that property is about social relations and political processes at the local level and argues that these are crucial factors in the practice of property relations. This paper is an important contribution to understanding legislation and institutional transformation processes as 'complex interactions between macro-systemic fields of force and the behaviours and interconnections of people caught up in them'. A special field of political, social and cultural relations has yet to be created so that exclusive private ownership could crystallize.

### Raiser, Martin (1997) 'Informal institutions, social capital and economic transition: reflections on a neglected dimension', European Bank for Reconstruction and Development Working Paper No. 25

This paper is an extensive analysis of the transition in Central and Eastern Europe from the institutional perspective. The author argues that the transitional economies are a promising terrain for applying institutional economics and here he focuses on a subset of institutional change: the role of informal institutions. The first part discusses theories of institutions and their importance and concludes with a stylized model of the role of formal and informal institutions in socio-economic development. The second part examines the theoretical models in the context of transition economies. The author examines two cases: that of a strong state (China and Germany) and of a weak one (Russia and Ukraine). He argues that rapid political change increases trust in governments. A separate section examines the role of informal institutions in privatization. The paper suggests that strength and legitimacy of the state has to be considered in designing institutions. Trust is found to depend positively on social capital. Trust in government is promoted by good political and economic performance. This paper relies on very general data and adopts some rather questionable theoretical assumptions. It also proposes a rather restrictive model that separates formal and informal institutions. However, it is a useful example of the scope of institutional economics and its contribution lies in raising numerous challenges for further research on institutions in transition.

## Paldam, Martin and Gert Tinggaard Svendsen (2000) 'Missing social capital and the transition in Eastern Europe', *Journal for Institutional Innovation, Development and Transition*, http://www.hha.dk/nat/WPER/00-5\_gts.pdf

The authors argue that a lack of social capital in the post-communist countries is a major factor in slowing transition despite the available human and physical capital that is available. Low GDP, low upswing and the rise of corruption are identified as the main characteristics of the transition despite the predictions of some economists for rapid growth. The authors argue that the reason for the latter

situation is that 'something intangible is missing' and they claim this is social capital defined by 'networks, trust, excess cooperation and Putnam's instrument'. Social capital is considered as a substantial force in production. Utilizing rational-choice theories, three hypotheses are introduced, that socialist regimes (being totalitarian regimes) destroyed social capital (or, as the authors call this 'the dictatorship theory of missing social capital' where by socialist regimes created fear and distrust and abolished voluntary organizations), secondly, that in order to grow, socialist systems needed and tolerated gray/black networks and finally, that post-socialist regimes converted the old gray/black networks into negative social capital. The decline in the old control systems and other problems associated with transition made these networks grow. In conclusion, the authors argue that several decades may be sufficient time for positive social capital to be built and that passive rather than active support should be provided in this process: that is, governments should enable the proper environment for generation of social capital.

### Dinello, Natalia (2001) 'Clans for market or clans for plan: social networks in Hungary and Russia', East European Politics and Society, Vol. 15 (3), pp. 589–624

This article utilizes network-focused and path-dependent interpretations of the transformations of post-communist economies. It examines the durability of pre-existing networks and the legacies of the past (not only socialist but also pre-socialist). The comparison between Russia and Hungary describes two almost opposite models of transformation grounded in the different histories of the states and their elite, as well as in the geographical location and international interaction. The metaphors of plan and clan are used to analyze the two cases and evaluate the factors, processes and outcomes of the first decade after socialism. The patterns of privatization and investment, vertical and horizontal accountability are explored too.

The Hungarian model is called clan for market, while the Russian clan for plan. The first does not exclude the involvement of the state and it favours the state as a vehicle for establishing legal order and enforcing universal rules. The second, in contrast, exists when self-imposed rules fail, or have not been attempted at all, and a strong state is employed to instil norms and discipline. The author defends the applicability of the term 'clan', and then explains the 'plan' and the 'clan' metaphors in detail, reviewing the major works in the field. The role of informal elite networks in the two countries is detailed. An extensive state history overview supports the main arguments.

The Hungarian elite networks are described as more open, fluid and inclusive due to the bourgeois tradition of pragmatic profit seeking and bargaining according to the principle 'give in order to get'. They are also more diffuse and ambiguous, constantly changing members and positions. In contrast to the Russian ones, they have having instrumental rather than primordial concerns about values and identity. These Hungarian features are also combined with a higher level of accountability through its well-developed political organization and small but still active civic association field.

The last section concludes with an account of the strengths of the concept of 'clan for plan' to predict the future developments in the region. Although there can be some positive role for the Russian clans (stabilizing transformations), there are also more dangers in this model than in the Hungarian one. There is a potential backlash against the failure to enforce a social contract in society which could also lead to a stagnation of society (suppression of individual freedoms and legal rights) under the pretext of stabilization. The author also brings up the dangers in the consolidation of the Russian elite arguing that this could be a blueprint for disaster.

Angelusz, Robert and Robert Tardos (2001) 'Change and stability in social network resources; the case of Hungary under transformation', in Nan Lin, Karen Cook and Ronald S. Burt (eds.) *Social capital: theory and research*, New York: Aldine de Gruyter

This chapter takes a network approach to institutional change with the authors suggesting that the concept of 'social-network resources' is more neutral and less biased than 'social capital'. In their view, the latter is more related to investment, yield, exchange and accumulation. The authors examine the significance of interpersonal network capital and its variations in context of transition. They compare data from before and after 1989. Analysing a variety of contexts as well as substantive and methodological problems, they argue that the strong-weak ties scheme by Granovetter is a useful frame of reference. The data used is quantitative and derived from several surveys (1987 – 1997). The results indicate that all social strata tend to interact more within their circles than outside. Compared with the situation before 1989, this kind of behaviour has become more common. Increased personal wealth has led to looser contacts and in conditioning family and kinship links. According to the authors, the most significant difference is the today's growing inequality in the access to network resources: non-family and non-kin resources have become scarce for a large segment in the lower strata of the population.

Szelenyi, Ivan and Szonja Szelenyi (1995) 'Circulation or reproduction of elites during the post communist transformation of Eastern Europe: Introduction', *Theory and Society*, 24 (5), Special issue on circulation vs. reproduction of elites during the post communist transformation of Eastern Europe, pp. 615–638

This volume is the result of a workshop held in Hungary which addressed a comparative research project studying the new elite in Eastern Europe. Scholars from the United States and Eastern European countries worked together on 'Social Stratification in Eastern Europe', conducting surveys in Russia, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland and Slovakia. This volume presents the comparative material on Russia, Poland and Hungary.

The introduction is a very useful summary of academic debates on the role of the elite in post-communist countries. One theory is that of elite reproduction, claiming that the power of the old elite remains despite their transformation. The theory of the circulation of the elite recognises some lasting powers of the old elite while they see the rising role of the new, anti-Communist elite. The new elite is likely to have less political capital but they more cultural capital. However, it is questionable if they will gain political power only or will also gain some economic power too.

The following sections explore in detail the findings of the survey for Russia, Poland and Hungary. The results neither fully support the elite reproduction nor an elite circulation theory. However, there is more support for the idea of elite circulation. The top-level Communist elite and the bureaucrats were mainly giving delegating powers while the technocrats (managers, specialist, etc) retained powerful positions. Some space, mainly in politics but also in culture and economy, was created for the new elite.

### Frane, Adam and Matevz Tomsic (2002) 'Elite (re-) configuration and politico-economic performance in post-socialist countries', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 54 (3), pp. 435–454

The article provides a comparative description of elite profiles in the post-socialist countries and addresses debates between theories of elite reproduction and elite circulation. The authors demonstrate how the elite in different countries differs in configuration as well as in type. The authors argue that these features determine the institutional changes in each country as they play a central role

of institution building. Through the case of Slovenia, the author demonstrates the need for further elaboration of the role of the elite allowing for the complexity of their formation and dynamics.

The main hypothesis put forward is that a degree of circulation within the political elite, as well as the inflow of new actors is a necessary precondition for the development of a modern democracy and sustainable economic growth. He argues that in small social systems like Slovenia, elite formation should not be addressed in a politicised sense but through arguments related to the quality of human resource management and as a matter of rational public discourse about national priorities. The role of the old elite is not seen to be as important as the formation of a counter elite and the establishment of a dynamic interaction between various segments of the elite. The practical measures suggested are indirect involvement in elite formation through incentives to increase the educational stratum and through insistence on meritocratic principles as a way of social promotion.

### Verheijen, Tony (ed) (1999) Civil service systems in Central and Eastern Europe. Civil Service systems in comparative perspective, Cheltenham: Edward Elgar

This volume contains extremely detailed factual descriptions of the past and the current transformations of the civil services in Russia, Yugoslavia, Bulgaria, Hungary, Poland, the Slovak Republic, Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania. It contains useful information on various models of civil services and their applicability to the transforming ones of Central and Eastern Europe. In terms of civil service development, the authors see three groups of countries - those applying for EU membership, those that are post-Soviet republics and those who are not yet EU candidates. All chapters contain data on internal labour market, politicisation, public opinion, reform and diffusion, configuration, representativeness, historical context and civil service reform.

## Marsh, Christopher (2000) Making Russian democracy work. Social capital, economic development and democratization, Studies in Russian History, Vol. 4, Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press

This book is theoretically grounded in the works of two scholars - Seymur Marin Lipset (Political Man: The Social bases of Modern Politics, 1960) and Robert Putnam (Making Democracies work: Civic Traditions in Modern Italy, 1993). According to Lipset, socio-economic modernisation creates the conditions which enable modern democracies to work and, according to Putnam, 'social capital' is the most salient criterion for the success of modern democracies. The study belongs to the growing body of literature in comparative political studies that addresses the regime-type and social change from a region-by-region approach. It is based on both qualitative and quantitative data and combines historical analysis with analysis of the contemporary situation. The first three chapters examine the nature of democracy in Russia. The following chapter examines the factors that play an important role in the process of democratisation - socio-economic developments and social capital. Chapter six examines the relationship between social capital and economic development and how this helps people adjust to economic difficulties. The author concludes that civic community is not a causal factor but it is a result of modernisation. The conclusion provides a discussion of the debate on the future of democracy in Russia.

The quantitative analysis of the relationship between civic community index and the index of democratisation confirm that social capital (with indicators of civic community) is important to democratic development. There is a negative correlation between civic community index and support of the regime. Higher levels of socio-economic development are negatively correlated with democratisation and positively associated with support for democratic regime. Or, higher levels of democratisation are associated with the civic community and negatively correlated with economic growth. Higher levels of socio-economic developments generate support for democratic regimes.

The main contribution of this book is the critical analysis (grounded in historical sources and qualitative data from contemporary Russia) of the propositions by some scholars that social capital is entirely missing from Russia. In contrast, the *blat* relationships could be a distinctively Russian form of social capital (involving trust and reciprocity horizontally) and an equivalent of the Northern Italian social capital.

# Rose, Richard, William Mishler and Christian Haerpfer (1997) 'Getting real: social capital in post communist societies', *Social Policy Working papers No. 278*, Glasgow: Centre for the Study of Public Policy, University of Strathclyde

The article describes how the relationship between individuals and institutions of civil society is central to theories of social capital and representative government. According to the authors, this relationship is contingent and depends on trust, which is a variable. The socialist regime has left a legacy of high levels of social capital. In the present changing environment, institutions are not trustworthy solely on the basis of the socialist legacies but because of the lack of democratic history in their development. The authors discuss the state of civil society during socialism and post-socialism and define and distinguish between social network capital and organizational capital. In the following sections they explore the concepts of trust, distrust and skepticism.

The results of the study are based on survey data of public attitudes in seven Central and East European countries: Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Slovakia, Hungary, Poland, Romania, and Slovenia. Stratified samples by region, city and urban/rural residence and a total of 10,087 interviews were conducted with about 1000 people in each state. Respondents were asked to evaluate fifteen different political and civil institutions - parties, courts, civil servants, government, the army, media, parliament, churches, trade unions, the president, patriotic societies, private enterprise, farmer's organizations and foreign organizations and experts advising the government. The results were divided in trusting, distrusting and skeptical.

Scepticism was a dominant attitude and mistrust was more prevalent than trust. The distribution of trust and distrust varies from one institution to another. The lowest is trust in trade unions. Standard deviations are highest for the President and for the churches, and lowest in the distrust in Parliament, parties and trade unions. Popular distrust is lowest in the Czech Republic. According to the authors, due to shared experience of Communism, the patterns of trust in civil and political institutions across the nine countries tend to be similar.

Further in the article, the authors explain the variations in trust and explore the possible sources of trust. Economic indicators have greatest influence on trust. The country effect is strongest in Bulgaria where people are much more distrustful than elsewhere, even after controlling for differences in performance and socialization factors. The last section discusses possible implications of the findings. The authors conclude that distrust lowers support for newly democratizing regimes and can even threaten their collapse and the establishment of non-democratic regimes. In their view the critical issue is the dynamics of institutions: will new regimes demonstrate trustworthiness or not?

### Stoner-Weiss, Kathryn (1997) Local heroes: the political economy of Russian regional governance, Princeton: Princeton University Press

The author follows Putnam and use membership of associations and societal levels of trust as indicators of the levels of social capital. She examines social capital in four Russian regions. The regions varied in terms of governmental performance and civil society while the levels of trust were low in all regions as well as no correlation with civic associations was found. The author concludes

that social capital had no influence on social structure, civil society and government performance. She argues that economic concentration is the most powerful determinant of variations in performance.

### Grabner, Gernot and David Stark (eds.) (1997) Restructuring networks in post-socialism. Legacies, linkages and localities, Oxford: Oxford University Press

This volume considers the ambiguities of post-socialist transformations as a resource as well as an obstacle for economic activity. The authors examine links through missing and loosened connections as well as through strong ones. The introduction outlines the major theoretical grounds and summarizes the findings of all contributors.

The editors, adhering to the evolutionary economics and organisational analysis, take issue with neo-liberal approaches to the transition. The volume suggests that national institutional homogenization might foster adaptation in the short run but at the cost of institutional diversity. The authors combine the latest achievements of network analysis and evolutionary theories to provide an alternative conception of development. As the authors state, the central premises of the volume is the firm (the actual economic unit) should not be the central focus of research but the networks linking firms and persons across them.

Networks are seen as active units of restructuring, not only objects for transformation. Localities are examined not as sites where proximity has shaped shared meanings but as sites where multiple interdependent meanings and social actions take place. Adhering to the path dependency theory, the authors argue that legacies are important for the future development of the economies in a dual way – they could either block or support transformations.

The first section of the book analyses the recombinant networks in the transformation and restructuring of large firms. The chapters include the more theoretical chapter by David Stark and case studies from the Czech Republic and Eastern Germany. The second section is the largest and addresses entrepreneurial networks in the formation of new firms. The case studies are on Russian commodity markets; small entrepreneurs in Hungary, restructuring in South-Eastern Poland; small businesses in the Czech Republic and the social and cultural embeddedness of entrepreneurs in Eastern Germany. The last section is on how policy networks restructure institutions, including a chapter on the antinomies of privatization in Eastern Europe; privatization by the state bureaucracy in Eastern Germany; the case of local government in Hungary and Russia and administrative transformations in Eastern Germany. The volume is an important contribution to the institutional change debates on Central and Eastern Europe. Not only does it propose a new perspective but it is also engaged in a rigorous and critical discussion with all the other major approaches to transformations in CEE. One of its contributions is that it argues that the introduction of networks as assets (e.g. network capital) undermines the relational dimension of network analysis. They propose not the study of networks as property but the properties of different kinds of networks.

#### Gill, Graeme (ed) (1998) Elites and leadership in Russian politics, London: Macmillan

This volume is a selection of papers from the Fifth International Congress of Central and East European Studies held in Warsaw in August 1995. It contains seven chapters from different theoretical and methodological standpoints examining various aspects of elite transformation in Russia. The second chapter deals with the parliamentary review of ministerial appointments, the third discusses the presidential prefects in the Russian provinces in the light of Yeltsin's regional cadres policies. The fourth chapter describes the clientelist norms at federal level. The fifth chapter analyses the nomenklatura in post-Soviet Russia in the transition from power to property. The sixth chapter analyses the role of the elite in the transition and the final chapter provides an overview of Russia as a

post-communist country. Both the 'transition to democracy' literature and the Soviet studies approaches are represented in this volume.

Several chapters focus on leadership questions (characteristic of much of the Soviet Studies) while others focus more on the examination of the crucial role of the elite in restructuring post-communist societies (typical for the 'transition to democracy' literature).

### Ganev, Venelin (2001) 'The Dorian Gray Effect: winners as state breakers in post communism', *Communist and Post-communist Studies*, Vol. 34 (1), pp. 1–25

This paper offers a very important insight into the relationship between post communist states and the economic groups that dominated the early stages of restructuring. The strategic interests and actions of such groups can hinder successful implementation of institutional changes, resulting in diminished state capacity and organisational incoherence. The author contributes to the study of the mutual effects between a closed elite network and 'state weakness'. He offers a historical investigation of the nature of redistribution conflicts, highlighting their underreported character and concluding that the strength of the 'winners' networks' perpetuates the deficits in good governance.

### Aberg, Martin and Mikael Sandberg (2003) Social capital and democratization. Roots of trust in post-communist Poland and Ukraine, Aldershot: Ashgate

This volume proposes a dynamic case study approach to the relationship between social capital and democratisation in Poland and Ukraine. The authors discuss the extent to which the reproduction of social capital reflects the legacies of previous regimes and socio-economic, ethnic and religious differentiation. They argue that the roots of some negative and positive social capital have their origins in pre-socialist times. Unfortunately, they provide a relatively uncritical endorsement of the idea of an East-West cleavage existing since the Middle Ages. They describe what they see as its lasting influence on the citizen-authority relations and levels of political capital in the two countries. The authors study the factors that influence the adaptation, modification and reproduction of democratic ideas, norms and practices. Using local and national data, the authors place Poland and Ukraine in a broader comparative perspective as well as provide a general theoretical analysis of post-communist democratisation.

The book has three parts. The first describes path dependencies in a historical perspective, the second, post-communist patterns while the third draws the lessons on social capital and democracy. The authors argue that Putnam's model is insufficient suggesting that Toqueville's emphasis on background factors plus institutional arrangements is a more useful explanation. Constitutional regimes and innovation play a vital role in social and political capital formation. In the authors' view, democratization is an evolutionary process of 'responsiveness to all citizens' involving selection and adaptation of new ideas, norms, beliefs and institutions and dynamic learning of these by both individuals and institution. They examine confidence in national and regional institutions, trust in different political issue areas and the emerging political parties and systems that are conducive to social and political capital development. Formal institutional arrangements are seen as playing a prominent role. Democracies are seen as being dependent on their historical, social and cultural foundations. One major shortcoming of the book is a rather essentialist division between cultural patterns in the East and West. Echoing the conclusion of Samuel Huntington, the authors agree that a politico-cultural 'clash' determines the initial phases of post-communist democratization.

### Petro, Nicolai N. (2001) 'Creating social capital in Russia: the Novgorod model', World Development, Vol. 29 (2) pp. 229–244

This article addresses a very important debate: can social capital be constructed by deliberate government policies. The author focuses on the case of Novgorod, where economic and political reforms have been successfully implemented and there has been an unusually high level of voter support for reform candidates. Levels of social capital are far higher than wealth, urban concentration, ethnicity and age distribution indicators would otherwise predict.

The author tends to assume that there was no social capital in the region before 1991 and his main question is how such high levels were created in such short time. The article provides a very detailed account of local government development strategies: e.g. to find foreign investment as an alternative to the lack of government or business investment, efficient privatization, and local cost-cutting measures, and others. Despite some setbacks, the local government has been successful in increasing the number of jobs and the regional administration has been supportive of the local government. The town has a Social Chamber where registered social organizations meet monthly thereby encouraging public involvement and debate. Civic organizations of various types thrive in Novgorod. The author draws parallels to the Indian province of Kerala, in particular, the success of the local government in facilitating acceptance of new social rules and codifying them in agreements and use them for conflict resolution. Thus as regards the three most common measures (as seen by this author) of social capital: economic development, trust in government and civic activism, Novgorod has developed a high level of social capital. This demonstrates, the author argues, that governments can gain from increasing level of public participation.

One of the insightful sections describes the role of the elite and the reasons why it supported change. The role of good governance and foreign investment were major factors that strengthened the elite. At times, the article does seem to suggest that local government has created all the social capital. Cultural and social capital is seen as mutually reinforcing and reviving old traditions of Novgorod (from the 12th –15th centuries). Although the author does not have many critical remarks to say about this process, the invention of tradition and the essentializing of culture can have negative effects, for example, where the past is used to support nationalistic or populist policies (e.g. in the speech cited in the article calling for the revival of 'Lord Novgorod-The-Great where Rus' originated'). However, the author sees cultural and historical myth as making a positive contribution to social capital because he argues that the past is seen as more of a model and inspiration than a burden.

## Uhlir, David (1998) 'Internationalization and institutional and regional change: restructuring post-communist networks in the region of Lanskroun, Czech Republic', *Regional Studies*, Vol. 32 (2), pp. 673–685

This aim of this article is to establish a framework for the analysis of regional change. Uhlir draws on a combination of network theory and the concepts of social and symbolic capital of Bourdieu. He argues that regional change in the Czech Republic can be analyzed as a combination of network restructuring and struggles for the redefinition of symbolic capital. The case of Lanskroun demonstrates that the symbolic capital of foreign investment may be combined successfully with local pre-1989 networks to invigorate regional economics. This article contributes to understanding the highly differentiated outcomes of the internationalization process in post-communist regional economies.

It begins with a perceptive discussion of the key concepts of networks and social and symbolic capital and then outlines the relationship between them and their relation to economic action and change. The author argues for the importance of addressing power issues, which is only possible by

supplementing the network approach with social and symbolic capital as developed by Bourdieu. It further explores the relevance of these concepts to the post-communist economies and the creation of regional inequalities. The third section describes Czech privatization as a path-dependant process. The last section presents the case study of Lanskroun based on data from unstructured and semi-structured interviews, analysis of newspaper articles and company reports, and participant observation in firms connected through subcontracting networks. The data supports the arguments of an evolutionary economy according to which the greater the variety of networks, the smoother their adaptability. The author's findings also support the assertions that the use of elements of the older institutional structures and their combination with the new ones will lead to institutionalization of more organic and stable socio-economic arrangements.

## Stark, David (1992) 'The great transformation? Social change in Eastern Europe. From system identity to organizational diversity: analyzing social change in Eastern Europe', *Contemporary Sociology*, Vol. 21 (3), pp. 299–304.

This article starts with a robust criticism of both the economists' view of a East European institutional collapse as a setting for bold initiatives of designer capitalism and also the political scientists view of institutional vacuum leading to paralysis and chaos. By contrast, the author suggests that Eastern Europe is undergoing a process of transformation (reshaping existing resources), rather than transition and an alternative account should break with state-centered views. Ethnographic studies and surveys have detected numerous social relationships that have continued after 1989. Relations of reciprocity and market-like transactions existed even during socialism. The author argues that changes in the old institutions might proceed slower than the building of new ones. Institutionalization is low and uncertainty high but the author argues that attempts to install a grand new design are misplaced. Instead, he proposes numerous solutions in a wide process of transformation where multiple agents act at different sites.

The next section of the article outlines promising lines of research. The specific institutional legacies should point to the existing patterns of state-society relations and this would open an avenue for adequate institutional change. Structural innovation in the economy would entail complex reconfiguration rather than immediate replacements. Instead of studying the organizational legacies of the socialist period, the author advises that we should focus on the informal networks that operated separately from formal structures. He also suggests that reintegration of segments of the old elite could be used to enliven the privatized enterprises. The purpose of research should be to investigate the characteristics of these networks – density, symmetry/asymmetry, old patterns, similarities and stability/ fluidity.

Small-scale producer's networks are considered another worthy field of exploration. Attention should be shifted from individual aspirations for entrepreneur-ship to broader features of localities that inhibit or encourage marketization. The author warns against hasty establishment of goals such as the marketization of all aspects of economic life. He reminds us that political economy has suggested more competitive operations exist based on 'networks', 'alliances', and inter-firm agreement', in other words, neither wholly market or statist forms.

# Beyer, Jurgen and Jan Wielgohs (2000) 'On the limits of path dependency approaches for explaining post socialist institution building: in critical response to David Stark', *East European Politics and Society*, Vol. 15 (2), pp. 356–388

This article is a critical response to some of the arguments outlined by David Stark in regards to institutional change in post socialist countries. It is a result from a research project called 'Preemptive

Institution Building' at Humbolt University Berlin and financed by Max Planck Gesellschaft zur Forderung der Wissenschaften.

The authors question how path-dependency theory relates to the major theoretical debates on post-socialist institution building. To what extent do the early assumptions of that theory explain current outcomes of the transition? What are the common features of Stark's approach and other theories of path dependency? The authors are critical of the implicit denial of political control over the process of transformation. They provide robust argumentation based on a broader set of case studies that there was a lot more room for manoeuvre than suggested by Stark. The ongoing political dynamics can have a relevant impact on further privatization policies. The major changes in the party composition of governments were followed by significant shifts in privatization policies. The authors recommend that the shortcoming of both creationist and legacy approaches can be overcome. At the same time they argue that it may be inappropriate to import special concepts embedded within a very distinct disciplinary context. In their view, the modes of transition will be the central variables explaining different paths.

### O'Neil, Patrick (1996) 'Revolution from within. Institutional analysis, transitions from authoritarianism, and the case of Hungary', *World Politics*, Vol. 48 (July), 579–603

This paper offers a critical examination of various approaches in the field of institutional analysis. The author stresses that although this perspective is gaining strength with political scientists it still suffers from a lack of definition and theoretical power. The author outlines some difficulties in the process of institutionalization such as creating inflexible institutions while the social environment remains dynamic. State socialism is reinterpreted as an institutional form and the Hungarian case is discussed in detail. In Hungary, the process of institutionalization depended on liberalizing policies as a means to co-opt (situate better through new links) society and the intelligentsia in particular. This legitimacy through social reconciliation and formal incorporation of intelligentsia both perpetuated the system as well as creating the means for its downfall.

The section on the emergence and development of the Reform Circle Movement (from 1988 onwards) is particularly rich in detail. The reform circles gained a lot of strength during socialism and weakened the regime. This resulted in the earliest (in comparison with other post-socialist countries) development of stable, competitive and articulated political organizations. The last sections of the article describe the political developments and institutional changes up to the elections of 1994. The prolonged erosion of the socialist regime in Hungary brought to life smaller and more articulated political organizations and no side was able to dominate the other. Political outcomes thus emerged more by default than by an institutional crafting. Another specific outcome in Hungary was that greater parliamentary stability was exhibited after 1989: the first democratic coalition government held power for its entire term, something which was unprecedented in the region. In the end, the result was a presidential institution with limited and ambiguous functions not unlike other post-socialist countries.

The article provides an insightful investigation into the connection between institutions, transitions and political reconstruction. The main conclusions center on the finding that legacies influence all processes of re-institutionalization. But the author argues that chance, individuals, domestic and international developments all have a tremendous impact on institutional forces. With this in mind, the institutional approach could further be tested.

### Hesli, Vicki L. and Arthur H. Miller (1993) 'The gender base of institutional support in Lithuania, Ukraine and Russia', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 45 (3), pp. 505–532

This article examines the role of women in post-socialist transition in terms of their support for democratic institutions and political reform. It begins with an overview of the various theories about the place of women in society and differences with men, such as biological, structural and situational considerations. However, the authors argue that the main explanation of women's attitudes towards reform is the lasting constraints experienced during socialism (despite some gains from that period). Today, the reasons for low support for reforms should not be sought in any 'conservatism' dating from socialism but rather in the contemporary situation of women and the limited social, economic and political opportunities they face. Women in Lithuania and urban women in particular were more supportive of transformation although all women are less supportive than men. The authors conclude with the description of the beginning of a women's movement in the region despite weak organization and a lack of regular membership. They argue that women's positions and therefore their levels of political participation may be improved when such movements transform women's concerns into political platforms.

### Matsuzato, Kimitaka (1999) 'Local elites under transition: county and city politics in Russia 1985–1996', Europe-Asia Studies, Vol. 51 (8), pp. 1367–1400

This article focuses on sub regional politics in Russia. It is based on case studies from six locales in two regions: Samara and Tambov. One of the strengths of the paper is that it directs attention to the importance of the personality of the leading politicians in political contests between the elite. The author criticizes the 'transition' perspective which holds that if the old elite is replaced with a young one, the democratization process will be speeded. He argues that sub regional politics has been a driving force for the transition of Russia's political regime from communist boss politics to post-communist *caciquismo* (one party dominance at the local level based on administrative, informal resources). The two regions have demonstrated significant differences: in Samara there is a transition to *caciquismo*, whereas in Tambov, the predominant tendency is partisanship which prevents the development of *caciquismo*. The paper explores the sociological structure of the local elite, their electoral politics, provides bibliographical data of elite leaders, and explains elite reconfiguration and succession. Elite continuation is pronounced in Samara while it is only mildly significant in Tambov.

The two regions differ also in political culture: pragmatic (Samara) versus idealistic (Tambov). The Samara elite profited by the lack of electorate attention to their moral or political constituency as long as they were good managers. By contrast, in Tambov it was important whether the leader was a 'defector' or not. Thus, the Samara elite has consolidated their position despite radical preferences of the Samara electorate in federal issues, while the Tambov elite is vulnerable to the federal political situation. The relationship between the regional and sub regional elite has also been important. In Samara, the relationship is described as 'live and let live', or 'tutelage and control' in contrast to the sporadic and tactless interference demonstrated by Tambov elite. The local representative organs in Tambov enjoy more competence and higher status than in Samara. This restrains the development of *caciquismo* and shows a tendency towards competitive electoral politics based on formal party structures. The post-socialist *caciquismo* emerges where political culture is pragmatic and votes are not cast for programs but for concrete interests or confidence in leaders and where local administration helps local bosses to consolidate their positions.

## Snavely, Keith (1996) 'The welfare state and the emerging non-profit sector in Bulgaria', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 48 (4), pp. 647–662

This article contributes to the welfare-state model understanding of the civil society, which focuses on the relations between the state and the non-profit organizations. The welfare state model is considered an apt approach for examining the social roles and functions of the non-profit organizations in Eastern Europe. The paper examines the specific case of Bulgaria and asks to what extent the non-profit organizations come to work alongside the state as an alternative to the bureaucracies for delivery of social/welfare services or alternatively, play a gap-filling role. The author describes the rapid growth of non-profit organizations in Bulgaria in the context of a 'disappearing state'. Several non-profit organizations are analyzed as case studies. The author concludes that although non-profit organizations show initiative and innovative behavior, they mirror the resource inadequacies of the state and their activities are very small on a social scale. The state and the NGOs are not in a strong position to complement each other's strengths and weaknesses. How the state and the NGOs might complement each other is not a priority on the list of desirable institutional changes. NGOs may be more suitable to play a modest role in gap filling rather than become an alternative to state bureaucracies in providing services.

A limitation of the paper is that it only briefly explores some of the reasons for the lack of service providing NGOs in Bulgaria. The only ones mentioned are a desire to reclaim the tradition of citizen support for cultural and educational institutions, the gap (financial and organizational) between the leading NGOs and the rest, and the continual citizen's higher service expectation of government than of private non-profit organizations.

### Mako, Csaba and Agnes Simony (1997) 'Inheritance, imitation and genuine solutions (Institution building in Hungarian labor relations)', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 40 (2), pp. 221–243

This article provides an insightful analysis of institution building in the Hungarian labour relations since the 1960s. The reforms weakened the subordination of labour relations to the monolithic political order. The opening sections describe the actors, institutions and strategies in labour relations in Hungary. The membership of unions has shrunk in all East European countries and in Hungary it is currently stabilised at about one third of the active wage earners. The main reasons for the decline in union density include unemployment, decentralisation, declining importance of manufacturing, increased political and ideological rivalry, cuts in social infrastructure by firms, open dialogue between management and employees, and individual working contracts.

The paper considers the legal regulations, institutions and levels of participation as the characteristic feature of the Hungarian labor relations since 1970s. Increased participation has allowed certain groups of employees to develop important social skills in evaluating and manipulating social and organizational situations, in negotiating and elaborating views of the enterprise and its environment. Although participation was transformed after the demise of socialism, it continues to serve as a means of communication between social partners as well as to prepare collective bargaining and prevent disputes. The Work's Councils have become a new element in labor relations, among whose purposes are to establish both horizontal and vertical ties with an ambition to gain political control.

In the concluding remarks, the author stresses the contradicting features of the labor relations and outlines their limits and achievements. Behind the theories, the everyday practice of labor relations is more 'opportunistic' in following participation, cooperative patterns, and others. This has led to a combination of 'old' and 'new' actors and institutions, legal regulation and traditions. Their legitimacy in the future could be the outcome of the interest conciliation tendencies.

Csergo, Zsuzsa (2002) 'Beyond ethnic division: majority-minority debate about the post-communist state in Romania and Slovakia', *East European Politics and Society*, Vol. 16 (1), pp. 1–29

The contribution of this article is its rigorous comparative analysis of national majority and Hungarian minority elite in Romania and Slovakia. These groups were prominent participants in defining institutional debates during the first post-communist decade. The choices of the majority and minority political elite in the process of institutionalising the state served as the most important factors in the dynamics of conflict and co-operation. The article also considers the potential for co-operation between the majority and minority elite, and the divisiveness of the institutional design of the nation-state.

The author concludes that it is inaccurate to explain political conflicts in Slovakia and Romania in terms of 'ethnic divisions'. Instead, he argues that during the first post-communist decade divisions within and among the majority and minority political parties were driven significantly by institutional and policy choices. Both majority elites defined the state as a unitary nation-state and both Hungarian minority parties defined the Hungarian community as a national community rather than an ethnic group. The emerging minority-majority divides arose in regards to the particular state-consolidating projects. In both states, a moderate majority elite emerged that did not espouse nationalistic state-building and formed coalition governments that included Hungarian minorities. They shared an understanding of a democratic government as a form of sovereignty in which the citizens of the state have a relatively large degree of self-government in their affairs. Consensual government allowed majorities and minorities to conduct an institutional debate that had the potential to reshape old institutions into 'habitable' spaces from both minorities and majorities.

Majority-minority relations certainly deserve a lot more complex analysis than that and cannot be reduced to elite politics. However, this article demonstrates one important aspect of minority-majority elite relations, the institutional debate that has the potential to provide an environment for increased mutual tolerance and cooperation. Particularly interesting details of this article reveal the cases of majority-minority elite cooperation or conflict in terms of institutional design and power contest rather than of primordial 'ethnic' origin.

Letki, Natalia (2002) 'Lustration and democratization in East-Central Europe', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 54 (4), pp. 529–552

Szczerbiak, Aleks (2002) 'Dealing with the communist past or the policies of the present? Lustration in post-communist Poland', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 54 (4), pp. 553–572

Tarifa, Fatos and Jay Weinstein (1995/6) 'Overcoming the past: de-communization and reconstruction of post-communist societies', *Studies in Comparative international Development*, Vol. 30 (4), pp. 63–77

The first two articles address the process of lustration (screening politicians and civil servants for past involvement with the communist regimes). They analyze the importance and lasting popularity of lustration in some countries as well as the relationship between lustration and democratization. The institutional clearance of old nomenklatura is not only related to the past but also becomes part of the contemporary power contest between the elite. The first paper provides a comparison of Central and East European countries in terms of the general mechanisms of lustration and its effects. It concludes that while there is no causal link between democratization and lustration, the latter has been found to be more positive rather than negative in the process of democratizing institutions. The second paper focuses on the lustration process in Poland and argues that more research should be conducted on the use of lustration as a tool in elite struggles and legitimation. The authors of the third article explore

▼ CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES WORKING PAPER SERIES

de-communization in Albania as a process of loss of human capital where technical experts from the previous regime are passed over. A new autocracy has been created as a result of lustration. The authors argue that to endorse tolerance as one of the effective foundations of the future a certain degree of 'forgetfulness' is necessary for successful transformation.

#### **AUTHOR INDEX**

Aberg, Martin, 41 Angelusz, Robert, 37 Anheier, Helmut K., 11

Balabanova, Dina, 31 Bedzar, Vasil, 22 Beyer, Jurgen, 43 Bjornskov, Christian, 7 Bobak, Martin, 31 Boehnke, Klaus, 27 Bougarel, Xavier, 11 Brainero, Elizabeth, 30 Brown, David, 21 Brunnell, Laura, 13 Burawoy, Michael, 4

Carlson, Per, 31 Cellarius, Barbara A., 10 Corrin, Chris, 15 Csergo, Zsuzsa, 47

Dershem, Larry, 32 Dinello, Natalia, 36 Dowley, Kathleen M., 12 Dunn, Elizabeth, 9

Engberg, Ulla, 8

Frane, Adam, 37

Gal, Susan, 15 Ganev, Venelin, 41 Gearing, Adam F., 9 Gibson, James L., 14 Gill, Graeme, 40 Grabner, Gernot, 40

Haerpfer, Christian, 6, 39 Hagan, John, 27 Hanley, Eric, 25 Hann, Chris, 4, 9 Hertzman, Clyde, 31 Hesli, Vicki L., 45 Hivon, Myriam, 19 Holland, Jenny, 17 Jones, Lynne, 32

Karpov, Vyacheslav, 26 Kaser, Michael, 29 Kawachi, Ichiro, 30 Kennedy, Bruce P., 30 Kharkhordin, Oleg, 15 Kligman, Gail, 15 Kolankiewicz, George, 18 Kramer, Martin, 14 Krzyszkowski, Jerzi, 17 Kubicek, Paul, 12 Kulcsar, Laszlo, 21

Lawson, Colin W., 22 Ledeneva, Alena V., 19 Letki, Natalia, 16, 47 Liikanen, Ilkka, 24 Lisovskaya, Elena, 26 Lonkila, Markku, 27 Luse, Agita, 15 Lylova, Oksana, 32

Mako, Csaba, 46
Marmot, Michael, 31
Marsh, Christopher, 38
Mateju, Petr, 6
Matsuzato, Kimitaka, 45
McKee, Martin, 31
McKeever, Matthew, 25
Merkens, Hans, 27
Miller, Arthur H., 45
Mishler, William, 39
Mondak, Jeffery, 9

Nanetti, Raffaella Y., 8 Neef, Rainer, 18 Noworthy, Thomas, 6

O'Brien, David J., 32 O'Neil, Patrick, 44 Orazem, Peter F., 24

#### ▼ CENTER FOR POLICY STUDIES WORKING PAPER SERIES

Paldam, Martin, 35 Patsiorkovski, Valeri V., 32 Petro, Nicolai N., 42 Phillips, David, 29 Pikhart, Hynek, 31 Priller, Eckhard, 11

Raiser, Martin, 6, 20, 35 Reitan, Therese C., 30 Rose, Richard, 31, 33, 39

Saltmarshe, Douglas K., 22 Sandberg, Mikael, 41 Sayer, John, 28 Shmulyar, Oksana, 22 Sik, Endre, 20, 21 Silver, Brian D., 12 Simony, Agnes, 46 Snavely, Keith, 46 Staddon, Caedmon, 10 Stark, David, 40, 43 Stoner-Weiss, Kathryn, 39 Stovel, Laura, 28 Stubbs, Paul, 8 Stulhofer, Alexander, 5 Swain, Nigel, 23 Szczerbiak, Aleks, 47

Szelenyi, Ivan, 37 Szelenyi, Szonja, 37

Tardos, Robert, 37 Tarifa, Fatos, 47 Tinggaard Svendsen, Gert, 35 Tomsic, Matevz, 37 Tomusk, Voldemar, 25 Tooley, James, 26

Uhlir, David, 42

Verdery, Katherine, 4, 35 Verheijen, Tony, 38 Vodopivec, Milan, 24

Wallace, Claire, 21, 22 Wallace, Clare, 6 Webber, Stephen, 24 Weinstein, Jay, 47 Wellman, Barry, 20 Wielgohs, Jan, 43 Wong, Raymond Sin-Kwok, 24 World Health Organisation, 30 Wroblewska, Wikoria, 33

Zimmer, Annette, 11